



**Office of the Secretary of Defense**  
**Reserve Forces Policy Board**  
*Annual Meeting Minutes*



**Wednesday, 10 September, 2014**

**Location of Meeting: Army Navy Country Club, Arlington, Virginia**

**Members Present**

1. MajGen Arnold Punaro, USMCR (Retired) - Chairman
2. MG Marcia Anderson, USAR - Deputy Chief Army Reserve (IMA)
3. SGM Michael Biere, USAR - Enlisted Military Advisor to the Reserve Forces Policy Board (Non-voting)
4. VADM John Cotton, USN (Retired)
5. Maj Gen H. Michael Edwards, ANG - The Adjutant General of Colorado
6. The Honorable Grier Martin, Member North Carolina House of Representatives
7. Ms. Dawn Halfaker, Captain, USA (Retired)
8. RADM Brian LaRoche, USN
9. MG William Wofford, ARNG, The Adjutant General of Arkansas
10. Mr. Sergio Pecori - President & Chief Executive Officer of Hanson Professional Services Inc.
11. Lt Gen James E. Sherrard III, USAFR (Retired)
12. Maj Gen James Stewart, USAFR - Military Executive of the Board (Non-voting)
13. Ms. Maria Vorel, Retired FEMA Disaster Operations Coordinator
14. MajGen Leo Williams III, USMCR (Retired)

**Invited Guests**

1. LTG David W. Barno, USA (Ret.), Senior Fellow & Co-Director of the Responsible Defense Program, the Center for a New American Security (CNAS)
2. Mr. Dennis Biddick, Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Navy for Manpower & Reserve Affairs and Total Force Integration
3. MG Kenneth Bouldin, USAR (Retired), RFPB Fellows Society
4. VADM Robin R. Braun, USN, Chief, Navy Reserve
5. The Honorable Stephen E. Buyer, Former Indiana Congressman, Citizen Patriot Individual Awardee
6. Dr. Janine Davidson, Senior Fellow for Defense Policy, Council of Foreign Relations
7. Ms. Mackenzie Eaglen, Resident Fellow, the American Enterprise Institute, Marilyn Ware Center for Security Studies
8. BG Walter E. Fountain, USA, Acting Deputy Director, Army National Guard
9. MG Mark Graham, USA (Retired), Senior Director, National Contact & Peer Support Center, Rutgers University
10. Mr. David Gillespie, A9 Studies & Analysis, Headquarters Air Force Reserve Command
11. MG Scott Gorske, ARNG, Assistant to CJCS for National Guard Matters
12. GEN Frank J. Grass, ARNG, Chief, National Guard Bureau
13. Mr. Todd Harrison, Senior Fellow, Defense Budget Studies, Center for Strategic and Budgetary Assessments (CSBA)
14. RADM James M. Heinz, USCG, Director, Reserve and Military Personnel
15. Lt Gen James Jackson, USAF, Chief, Air Force Reserve
16. BG Walter Lord, ARNG, Nominated Board Member/Military Executive (Select)
17. MG Gus Hargett, ARNG (Retired), President of the National Guard Association of the United States

18. MajGen Andrew Davis, USMCR (Retired), Executive Director of the Reserve Officers Association
19. Lt Gen Richard P. Mills, USMC, Commander, Marine Forces Reserve
20. Mr. Raymond F. Rees, DASA M&RA
21. ADM Michael S. Rogers, USN, Commander, U.S. Cyber Command
22. CDR Jesus Santiago, OIC, Naval Mobile Construction Battalion Two Five (NMCB 25),  
Citizen Patriot Unit Award
23. LTG Jeffrey W. Talley, USA, Chief, Army Reserve
24. Ms. MaryAnn Tierney, Regional Administrator for FEMA Region III
25. Maj Gen William Waldrop, USAFR, Assistant to the CJCS for Reserve Matters
26. Mr. Richard Wightman, Jr., Acting Assistant Secretary of Defense for Reserve Affairs
27. MajGen Cornell Wilson, I, USMCR (Retired), Governor's Military Advisor, North Carolina
28. Brig Gen James C. Witham, ANG, Deputy Director, Air National Guard

#### **RFPB Staff**

1. Col Jay Jensen, USAFR
2. Mr. Alexander Sabol, DoD Civilian (DFO)
3. CAPT Jay Gagne, USNR
4. Col Reidar Larsen, USMCR
5. COL Timothy Lynch, USAR
6. LTC Brad Martsching, ARNG
7. Lt Col Troy Pou, ANG
8. LT Todd Smith, USCGR
9. SMSgt Joyce Voyles, USAFR
10. SFC India Boddie, ARNG
11. Ms. Cindy Tyrie, DoD Contractor

#### **Public Observers**

1. Ms. Collen Appleton
2. Mr. Craig Bambrough
3. Mr. Paul Bergson
4. CAPT Robert Bennett, USN, DASN M&RA
5. Mr. Michael Brush
6. LCDR Lena Buettner, Chief, Navy Reserve Flag Aide
7. Ms. Joni Buyer
8. Mr. Ryan Buyer
9. Ms. Ashlyn Buyer
10. Maj Greg Champion OASD RA
11. Maj Gen Martin Carpenter, USAF (Ret)
12. Mr. Robert Carrington, OUSD P&R, Suicide Prevention
13. Mr. Edward A. Cercone
14. LTC John Paul Cook, USAR
15. Timothy Cooper, Senior Chief, NMCB25 CONUS Ops Chief
16. MajGen John Coyne, USMC (Retired)
17. Ms. Kelly Craven
18. COL John Curran, USA (Retired)

19. Lt Gen Russell Davis, ANG (Retired)
20. LTC Laurel Devine, OCAR PAO
21. COL Krin Dixon, OASD RA
22. Mr. John Earnest
23. Mr. Bob Fielder
24. Mr. Jason W. Forrester, DASD RA (M&P)
25. Mr. Robert Green
26. Mr. Tom Jones
27. Mr. John Hastings, DASD RA (Resources)
28. LCDR Richard Hoeg, NMCB 25 CONUS OIC
29. LCDR Timothy Kaber, NMCB 25 CONUS OIC
30. COL Martin Klein, USAR, OCAR Executive Officer
31. CMSgt James Hotaling, ANG, Command Chief of the ANG
32. Jerome Howard, WHS Photographer
33. GEN George Joulwan, USA (Retired)
34. Mr. Anthony Kinn, SAF/IEI Advisor
35. LTC Vladimir Kolchanov, Assistant Military Attaché, Russian Embassy
36. Mr. Bobby Lanisden,
37. MajGen James Lariviere, USMCR
38. Lt Gen Joseph Lengyel, ANG, Vice Chief NGB
39. PSA Lurng, OCNGB
40. MG Gregory Lusk, ARNG (TAG NC)
41. LTC Tom Oakley, USCAPOC
42. Mr. Guy Sands-Pingot, OCAR, Director of Human Capital
43. Maj Gen Harvey McCarter, USAF (Retired)
44. Mr. Paul Patrick, DASD RA (RT&M)
45. COL Robert Preiss, ODASA M&RA
46. The Honorable William Navas (Former RFPB Chairman)
47. Mr. Terry O'Connell, (Former RFPB Chairman)
48. Brig Gen Randall Ogden, USAF, Total Force Continuum
49. MG Paul Rehkamp, USA (Retired)
50. Col Ken Rosado, NGB
51. CWO George Rubesha (Retired)
52. Mr. Andrew "Ike" Ryan, USMCR HQ
53. MAJ Michael Shamely, CAR Aide
54. Col Theodore Silvester, CoS USMC MARFORRES
55. Ms. Julie Small, (VBA)
56. CW2 Soluios, NGB
57. MG Bob Tanguy (Retired)
58. MajGen Larry Taylor, USMC (Retired)
59. SA Thompson, OCNGB
60. Mr. Andrew Tilman
61. Mr. John Vaumrie
62. COL Carol Closs-Walford, ARNG, G5

- 63. MG William Waff, USAR, Chairman, Army RFPC
- 64. Maj Gen Jerry White, USAF (Ret)
- 65. Honorable Al Zapanta (Former RFPB Chairman)
- 66. Maj Gen Sheila Zuehlke, USAFR, U.S. Cyber Command

0802 – Chairman Punaro administratively opened the Board to conduct required administrative business.

- The Chairman thanked the staff, recognized key individuals and commented on the RFPB Dinner and Secretary James' speech.
- The Chairman welcomed members and guests including Brigadier General Walter Lord who will join the Board and assume duties as the Board's Military Executive on 1 October.
- The Chairman reviewed the Board's work over the past year, noting the Board has submitted three reports and seventeen recommendations to the Secretary of Defense and that copies of the Cyber Report were included in the meeting binders.

0805 - Military Executive provided additional administrative announcements to the Board.

- Welcomed guests, members, and recently assigned Board Staff.
- Provided administrative announcements.
- Reminded members and guests of his Retirement Ceremony at the end of the month.

0810 - Chairman Punaro presided over an awards ceremony for departing Board members Ms. Maria Vorel and Major General (Retired) Leo Williams. Chairman Punaro also recognized departing Board members the Honorable Gene Taylor and Ms. Paulette Mason who were unable to attend the meeting.

0815 - Chairman Punaro administered the oath to Rear Admiral Brian LaRoche and Ms. Dawn Halfaker.

0817 - Board commenced business in Open Session.

- The Chairman called the meeting to order and announced, as required by the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), the Designated Federal Officer is present and has pre-approved the opening of this meeting and its agenda.
- The Chairman announced the meeting was open to the public and noted that no persons had submitted requests to appear before the Board. The Chairman asked if anyone present wished to address the Board and no one indicated a desire to do so.

0820 - President, Reserve Forces Policy Board Fellows Society - Major General (Retired) Kenneth Bouldin

- MG (Retired) Bouldin noted that his term was ending and offered his belief that the Fellows Society has fallen short in being a relevant resource for the Board and could be better utilized.
- MG (Retired) Bouldin invited departing Board members to join the Fellows Society.
- The Chairman thanked MG (Retired) Bouldin for his service and underscored his comments, noting that many of the issues we are dealing with today were dealt with in the past.

0835 - Commander, US Cyber Command Remarks - Admiral Michael S. Rogers, USN

- Admiral Rogers opened by thanking the Board for their service and the opportunity to address the important topic of RC integration into the Cyber Mission Force.

- He spoke of his father’s service in the National Guard and that he is pre-disposed to the notion that the Reserve Components should be part of the solution.
- He emphasized that he is the joint operational commander, while the services man, train and equip. He highlighted the four touchstones he provided to the services to guide their force development efforts:
  - Consider a full spectrum capability that does not start by assuming the force must be active component.
  - One training standard for all.
  - One set of team compositions that applies across components to enable plug and play.
  - One command and control structure for employment of the force.
- He then highlighted his three mission sets (protect the nation’s critical infrastructure; provide Combatant Commanders a full spectrum of capabilities; and defend the Department of Defense network infrastructure) and stated that each service arrived at a slightly different solution in developing their forces. The U.S. Marine Corps cyber force is active component only while the others integrate various levels of Reserve Component service members and units.
- He agreed with the conclusions in the RFPB’s Cyber Report, but stated that the organizations and structure should be tested and stabilized, rather than continually reorganizing.
- Mr. Sergio Pecori, a member of the Board, commented that some of the Board’s recommendations followed his comments and asked about standardized training requirements. Admiral Rogers responded that he recognized that some service members are already doing the mission so Cyber Command has established a board to assess equivalency and provide the services flexibility in qualifying their cyber warriors. He expressed concern regarding reductions in Reserve Component funding and closed by emphasizing he will not accept an “us versus them” mentality and that we all must work together, as one enterprise and one team.

0932 – Chief, National Guard Bureau Remarks – General Frank J. Grass, USA

- General Grass thanked Chairman Punaro and the Board for providing him an opportunity to participate in the Board’s annual meeting.
- He expressed his belief that we are on a fiscal glide path to destroy our military and become a second rate military power as we need billions of dollars for investment in key capabilities beyond 2023.
- General Grass spoke of today’s National Guard and highlighted that it transitioned from a strategic reserve to an operational force because resources were made available. He also provided examples demonstrating that the National Guard is accessible, capable, ready, and affordable.
- General Grass identified fiscal realities under the Budget Control Act as our most significant challenge and provided examples of budget impacts.
- General Grass also identified numerous opportunities to include cyber forces, multi-component units, partnerships, and integrated homeland planning.

1026 - Reserve Component Chiefs Panel

- Each of the Chiefs provided their views on top challenges and opportunities for the Reserve Components and the implications of diminishing resources on Reserve Component force structure, readiness, and Active-Reserve Component relations.
- VADM Braun, Chief, Navy Reserve, stated that the Navy Reserve is making a global impact and highlighted an initiative to get sailors back to sea and mentioned that they have proposed an expansion to their Reserve Component skills database to achieve greater awareness of civilian acquired skills.

- LTG Talley, Chief, Army Reserve, suggested that since we cannot afford to maintain the size of regular Active Component forces that we would like, the operational reserve is here to stay. He noted intent to move away from available year utilization to utilization throughout a unit's readiness life-cycle. He suggested that the Reserve Components could be more innovative in their approaches to training and operational use, offering the thought that his units might, in the near future, partner with private companies to conduct training overseas that could provide training value to reservists, benefit local nationals, and support U.S. diplomatic and development objectives.
- LtGen Mills, Commander, Marine Forces Reserve, stated that the USMCR mirrors the active force and hopes to harvest a lot of the talent leaving active duty. He highlighted the fact that reserve Marines are integrated into operations and exercises around the world and his concerns about readiness, contract maintenance, and modernization.
- BG Fountain, Special Assistant to the Director, Army National Guard, provided his thoughts on mobilization policies like those in the "Utilization of the Force Memo" and the fact that they are being used to establish the AC/RC force mix and potentially skew information used in senior leader decisions. He quoted a passage from General Grass to the Chief of Staff of the Army and Air Force stating "Two-year notice, nine-months boots on the ground, 30-day individual notice, not more than 50 percent of a state's force structure deployed at once and other policies were helpful over the last decade, but they should not govern force planning assumptions for future contingencies" and offered that the Board should consider the topic. Chairman Punaro agreed with the recommendation and assigned the topic to the Operational Reserve Subcommittee.
- Lt Gen Jackson, Chief, Air Force Reserve, recommended the Board look at the British re-organization and migration of personnel and resources into their reserves and the new U.S. Air Force strategy. He also gave examples of how the Air Force Reserve provides operational capabilities and strategic depth on a daily basis.
- Brig Gen Witham, Deputy Director, Air National Guard, noted that modernization account diversions hit the Air Guard harder as their aircraft are generally older. For example, older tactical lift aircraft need navigation upgrades or they will be unable to operate in international airspace in the very near future. Similarly, the Air National Guard will equip its first F-35 unit in about four years, but the second unit will not receive aircraft for another five to six years.
- RADM Heinz, Director, USCG Reserve and Military Personnel, noted that, as it is for all of his colleagues, funding is his most significant challenge. For example, they have 7,500 service members today and are reducing to around 6,900 despite 8,100 being identified as the floor. Additionally, they have enough money to pay for drill duty, but very little funding for anything else. That is, in turn, challenging their ability to generate readiness.

#### 1224 - Lunch and Presentation of Awards

- Citizen Patriot Unit Award was presented to Naval Mobile Construction Battalion Two Five.
- Citizen Patriot Individual Award was presented to The Honorable Stephen E. Buyer.

#### 1305 - Think Tank Panel

- LTG (Retired) David W. Barno, USA, Senior Fellow and Co-Director of the Responsible Defense Program at the Center for a New American Security (CNAS), commented on readiness, force structure, and relationships, largely focusing on the Army. He noted that the strong Active and Reserve Component relationships built over 13 years of war have eroded over the last year and a half. He highlighted force structure changes like the Army's Aviation Restructuring Initiative as an issue that strained relationships, but stated that there were others. He also noted that readiness is a product of how much money and time is provided for training, equipment, etc.

- Mr. Todd Harrison, Senior Fellow for Defense Budget Studies at the Center for Strategic and Budgetary Assessments (CSBA), continued the readiness theme and believes the way we measure readiness is wrong as the current system measures inputs instead of performance.
- Ms. Mackenzie Eaglen, Resident Fellow at the American Enterprise Institute Marilyn Ware Center for Security Studies, also discussed relationships and stated that Air Force component tensions started around 2005, even before BRAC. She also touched on compensation and expressed her belief that we have prioritized retirees over current forces.
- The Chairman commented that budgets have doubled but the size of the force has been halved.

1437 – Maj Gen H. Michael Edwards, Subcommittee Chair, provided an update from the Subcommittee on Enhancing DoD’s Role in the Homeland.

- Maj Gen Edwards updated the Board on the history and status of policies and funding for Presidential Nominating Conventions and other National Security Special Events. He previewed draft recommendations and noted that earlier integration of National Guard and other Department of Defense stakeholder requirements would aid the process. The Subcommittee will attempt to schedule meetings on the topic and prepare a comprehensive package.
- He noted the Subcommittee plans to examine a new topic to determine if strategies, policies, and practices related to the RC and civil support are consistent.
- Chairman Punaro commented that this ties back to DHS and the Department’s struggles to identify Homeland Defense requirements.

1455 - MG Marcia Anderson, Subcommittee Chair, provided an update from the Subcommittee on Creating a Continuum of Service.

- MG Anderson provided members an update on subcommittee recommendations associated with the Reserve Component Survivor Benefit Plan and the revision and reduction of the total number of duty statuses.
- MG Anderson also discussed a new issue regarding medical hold duty status for RC members. Under current law, medical hold does not qualify for the accrual of Post-9/11 GI Bill benefits. The services and OSD are pressing to include a legislative change to address the issue in the 2016 NDAA.
- The subcommittee proposed the board approve the following recommendation:

The Secretary of Defense should approve a pending Unified Legislation and Budgeting proposal which would add Title 10 12301(h) (i.e. medical hold) as a period of "active duty" under Title 38, Section 3301 (1)(B) for the purpose of accruing Post-9/11 GI Bill benefits.

- A motion was made to forward the recommendation to the Secretary of Defense. The motion was seconded and approved by the Board without objection.
- MG Anderson then introduced MG (Retired) Graham as a guest speaker.
- MG (Retired) Graham briefed the Board and attendees on the Vets4Warriors program that provides immediate, one-on-one peer counseling and follow-up support for Active Duty, National Guard and Reserve service members and their families through a network of Veterans who understand the challenges of military life. The program:
  - Uses a Peer-to-Peer format unlike many others.
  - Employs 38 Veterans that provide confidential counseling or connect members with other services on a 24/7 basis (no phone trees or delays).
  - Turns no one away or ever puts them on hold.

- Is sponsored by the Defense Suicide Prevention Office and answers nearly 200k calls annually.
- The service is especially useful for Reserve and Guard Soldiers and families. The program's primary issue is in advertising and lack of general awareness on the part of potential users. The Board members were impressed and expressed their support for the program.

1540 - VADM (Retired) John Cotton, Subcommittee Chair, provided an update from the Subcommittee on Ensuring a Ready, Capable, Available and Sustainable Operational Reserve.

- VADM (Retired) Cotton provided a brief update on Reserve Component medical readiness and a follow-up to the March 2014 “RC Attitudes” presentation.
- RC medical readiness has improved since the subcommittee first started tracking the statistics in 2010-2011 but ground components continue to lag behind other components. A recent change to the frequency of certain labs like HIV is the driver of a recent down turn.
- In a follow-up to his March 2014 presentation on RC Attitudes, VADM (Retired) Cotton reported that follow-up analysis of employers reinforced our earlier assertions about employer support for reserve component participation. He noted that the vast majority of employers (86%) are satisfied with the Reserve Component employees in their businesses.

1546 - The Military Executive presented several administrative proposals to the Board during the “Chairman’s Time.”

- Major General Stewart proposed, and the Board approved, the Report layout for the Fiscal Year 2014 Reserve Forces Policy Board Annual Report to the President and Congress; The Board approved the following content:
  - Executive Summary
  - Introduction
  - Summary of meetings
  - Overview
  - RFPB Reports of Advice and Recommendations to the Secretary
  - Impact of Recommendations Made
  - Appendix 1- RFPB Members and Staff
  - Appendix 2- Governing Statute
  - Appendix 3- Reserve Component Contributions to the National Defense
- Approved subcommittee structure and new assignments are as follows:
  - Subcommittee on Ensuring a Ready, Capable, Available and Sustainable Operational Reserve
    - VADM (Retired) Cotton – Chair
    - General (Retired) Handy
    - Ms. Halfaker
    - Dr. Nagl
    - Lt Gen (Retired) Sherrard
    - BrigGen Whitman
  - Subcommittee on Enhancing DoD’s Role in the Homeland
    - Maj Gen Edwards – Chair

RDML Hinrichs

- BG Lord
- MG Wofford
  
- Subcommittee on Supporting & Sustaining Reserve Component Personnel
  - MG Anderson – Chair
  - RADM LaRoche
  - Hon. Martin
  - Mr. Pecori
  - SGM Biere
  
- The Chairman noted that new members would be assigned once approved for membership.
- Finally, Maj Gen Stewart proposed the following tentative dates for FY15 Board Meetings:
  - 10 December 2014
  - 11 March 2015
  - 3 June 2015
  - 2 September 2015
  - The Chairman requested that Board members be flexible on the December and March dates to meet availability of the Secretary of Defense.
  
- The motion was seconded and approved by the Board without objection.

1554 - The Reserve Forces Policy Board concluded business in Open Session and the meeting was adjourned.



Arnold L. Punaro  
Major General, USMCR (Ret)  
Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board