



Office of the Secretary of Defense
Reserve Forces Policy Board
Quarterly Meeting Minutes



Wednesday, 11 March 2015
Location of Meeting: Pentagon Room 3E863

Members Present

1. Major General Arnold Punaro, USMCR (Ret) - Chairman
2. Major General Marcia Anderson, USAR
3. Lieutenant General David W. Barno, USA (Ret)
4. Sergeant Major Michael Biere, USAR (Non-voting)
5. Dr. Janine Davidson
6. Major General H. Michael Edwards, ANG
7. The Honorable Grier Martin
8. Ms. Dawn Halfaker, Captain, USA (Ret)
9. Rear Admiral Brian LaRoche, USN
10. Mr. Sergio Pecori
11. Rear Admiral Kurt Hinrichs, USCGR
12. Major General Walter Lord, ARNG (Non-voting)
13. Major General Cornell Wilson, I, USMCR (Ret)

Invited Guests

14. Mr. Dennis Biddick, Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Navy
15. Mr. Robert Daigle, Director, Military Compensation and Retirement Modernization Commission
16. Brigadier General Ivan Denton, ARNG, Director, National Guard Bureau J1
17. General Frank J. Grass, Chief, National Guard Bureau
18. Admiral William Gortney, USN, Commander, U.S. Northern Command
19. Mr. Robert B. Green, RFPB Fellows Society
20. Major General Scott Gorske, ARNG, Assistant to CJCS for National Guard Matters
21. Mr. John T. Hastings, DASD Resources, OASD RA
22. Major General Donald A. McGregor, USAF, Director, National Guard Bureau J5
23. Mr. Raymond F. Rees, DASA (M&RA)
24. Mr. Robert H. Smiley, PDASD Readiness, Training, & Mobilization, OASD RA
25. Lieutenant General Robert Schmidle, Jr., USMC, Principal Director, Cost Assessment and Program Evaluation
26. Major General William D. R. Waff, Chairman, Army Reserve Forces Policy Committee
27. Major General William Waldrop, Assistant to the CJCS for Reserve Matters
28. The Honorable Jessica L. Wright, Under Secretary of Defense for Personnel and Readiness
29. The Honorable Albert C. Zapanta, RFPB Fellows Society

RFPB Staff

1. Colonel Jay Jensen, USAFR
2. Mr. Alexander Sabol, DoD Civilian (Designated Federal Officer)
3. Colonel Ty Clifton, USAR

4. Captain Jay Gagne, USN
5. Colonel Reidar Larsen, USMCR
6. Colonel Timothy Lynch, USAR
7. Colonel Brad Martsching, ARNG
8. Lieutenant Colonel Troy Pou, ANG
9. Lieutenant Todd Smith, USCGR
10. Senior Master Sergeant Joyce Voyles, USAFR
11. Sergeant First Class India Boddie, ARNG
12. Sergeant First Class Sinanli Ouattra, USAR, MIRC 163/57
13. Sergeant First Class Akuba Stegemann, USAR, MIRC G317
14. Ms. Cindy Tyrie, Administrative Assistant

Public Observers

1. Major General Deborah Ashenurst, Representative, Office of Chief, National Guard Bureau
2. Captain Robert Bennett, USN, DASN (M&RA)
3. Colonel Tim Connelly, OASA (M&RA)
4. Mr. Justin Doubleday, Inside the Army Reporter
5. Mr. Bob Fiedler, Reserve Officer Association
6. Lieutenant Colonel Eric Givens, OCAR
7. Commander Gwen Graves, USN, DASN M&RA
8. Captain Wayne Gunter, USN, Readiness, Training, & Mobilization, OASD RA
9. Colonel John Hickey, USA, Readiness, Training, & Mobilization, OASD RA
10. Mr. Jerome Howard, WHS Photographer
11. Lieutenant Colonel Fran Ispoliro-Bennett, USMCR, DASN M&RA
12. Lieutenant Colonel George Lewis, NGRM
13. Captain Rhonda Powell, OCAR
14. Colonel Ed San Nicolas, ARNG, National Guard Bureau J5/J35
15. Rear Admiral Duncan Smith III, USCGR (Ret)
16. Elaine Simmons, SES, Deputy Director Analysis and Integration, Cost Assessment and Program Evaluation
17. Major General (Ret) Larry Taylor, RFPB Fellows Society

0800 – Chairman Punaro administratively opened the Board to conduct required administrative business

- The Chairman welcomed members and staff and noted that he would swear in members later in the meeting.
- The Chairman welcomed members or invited guests to comment at any point throughout the meeting.

0802 - Military Executive provided additional administrative announcements to the Board

- Provided administrative announcements.
- Reminded members and guests to leave electronic devices outside the room and turn them off.
- Noted that Board Member BrigGen Burke Whitman could not attend the meeting but had been nominated by the Secretary of Defense for promotion to Major General.

- Thanked the U.S. Army Reserve for providing two service members to help with running the meeting.

0805 - Chairman Punaro administered the oath to Ms. Janine Davidson, LTG (Ret) David Barno, and MajGen (Ret) Cornell Wilson

0807 - Chairman Punaro presided over an awards ceremony for departing Board member Maj Gen Michael Edwards and supporting staff augmentee SMSgt Joyce Voyles

0810 - Chairman Punaro provided additional administrative comments and instructions to the staff

- Chairman Punaro directed the staff to send members of the Board copies of Secretary Carter's Advanced Policy Questions and Questions for the Record related to his confirmation hearing with the Senate Armed Services Committee.
- Chairman Punaro provided context for the Advanced Policy Questions and Questions for the Record and described in broad terms some of the responses.

0821 - Opening Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board – MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- The Chairman called the meeting to order and announced, as required by the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), that the Designated Federal Officer was present and had pre-approved the opening of the meeting and the agenda.
- The Chairman announced the meeting was open to the public and noted no persons had submitted requests to appear before the Board. The Chairman asked if anyone present wished to address the Board and no one indicated a desire to do so.
- The Chairman invited attendees to provide thoughts or comments to his overview of Secretary Carter's Advanced Policy Questions and Questions for the Record. LTG (Ret) Barno noted the Department of Defense should review deployment / mobilization-to-dwell ratios and the rationale behind it and the Chairman ensured the staff was reviewing the issue.
- GEN Grass commented about National Guard mobilizations during the wars in Iraq and Afghanistan.
- GEN Grass also noted the different approaches the Army and the Air Force are taking with respect to Title 10 12304(b) mobilization authority that allows use of the reserve component (RC) to augment the active component (AC) for missions in support of Combatant Command requirements. He noted that the Air Force was budgeting for those deployments while the Army was not.
- GEN Grass also expressed concern that if all of the National Guard AH-64 Apache helicopters were moved into the AC and the Army reduced to 20 AC Apache battalions, the Army would lack capacity to train with RC divisions and brigade combat teams and hinder their readiness.

0845 - Subcommittee Updates

- MG Marcia Anderson, Subcommittee Chair, provided an update from the Subcommittee on Supporting and Sustaining Reserve Component Personnel.
 - MG Anderson updated members on a July 2013 RFPB recommendation and current USD (P&R) proposal (as mandated by the 2015 NDAA) to reduce the total number of reserve duty statuses. P&R completed the required response to Congress which explained the Department will review the recommendations in the Military Compensation and Retirement Modernization Committee (MCRMC) Report in lieu of providing a separate proposal.

- MG Anderson provided an update on two other RFPB recommendations. In September 2014, it was recommended that Secretary of Defense (SecDef) approve a pending Unified Legislation and Budgeting proposal which would add Title 10 12301(h) (i.e. medical hold) as a period of "active duty" under Title 38, Section 3301 (1)(B) for the purpose of accruing Post-9/11 GI Bill benefits. In May 2013, the RFPB recommended the Department change the law regarding the RC Survivor Benefit Plan, to achieve parity between "Active Duty" and "Inactive Duty" survivor benefits. Both recommendations were submitted to the Office of Management and Budget on December 19, 2014 and are now at the Hill for consideration in the 2016 NDAA.
- MG Anderson provided an update regarding their February subcommittee meeting on management of the Individual Ready Reserve (IRR) in the RCs. It was discussed that many of the issues impacting effective IRR management have existed for years. Key findings included:
 - a lengthy mobilization process results in IRR members out of sync with their units;
 - neither USAF or USN significantly accessed the IRR for OIF/ONE;
 - all components experience significant tracking/screening issues of IRR personnel;
 - there is a common desire among the services to maintain high-demand-low-density skillsets in the IRR for easier access.
- MG Anderson noted potential areas for further study would include USA IRR management, re-establishment of the OSD-sponsored, annual IRR conference, officer commissioning (scrolling) process, lessons learned from other nations, monitor progress/findings of USMCR CNA Study, and USN Career Intermission Pilot Program.
- LTG (Ret) Barno asked if there had been lessons learned efforts on the use of the IRR during OIF or OEF and no one was aware of any.
- MG Anderson closed the discussion by emphasizing the increasing importance of the IRR during periods of reduced end strength and budgets. She stated the IRR has not significantly changed since the 1980's and it is important to determine what we want the IRR to look like and how we will manage its 270,000 members for maximum benefit in the 21st Century.
- SGM Michael Biere, Enlisted Military Advisor to the Chairman, RFPB, provided observations on his recent visit to Fort Gordon, GA with Chairman Punaro and MG Lord.
 - SGM Michael Biere noted the significant growth and investment at Ft. Gordon along with family housing and school issues. He also noted Signal and Cyber School leader perspectives and their challenges associated with educating service members in this emerging area. One highlight was information provided by the USAR that they were building structure to accommodate AC members leaving active duty to enable them to continue to serve.
 - MG Lord noted the excellent representation of RC soldiers among the graduates of the Signal Course Class they visited.
- Maj Gen Edwards, Subcommittee Chair, provided an update from the Subcommittee on Enhancing DoD's Role in the Homeland.
 - Maj Gen Edwards provided an update on National Special Security Events funding for military capabilities and noted plans to work with Ms. Tierney's staff in FEMA Region III and observe the process during their upcoming National Special Security Events. He also noted conversations he had with Mr. Thomas Atkin, Principal Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense for Homeland Defense and Global Security, and the Directors of National Guard Bureau J-37 and J-5 and that all three agreed to review the issue.
 - Maj Gen Edwards also thanked Dr. Davidson for meeting with the the subcommittee's staff members as part of the examination of the consistency of strategies, policies, and practices with respect to the homeland. Dr. Davidson provided the staff the broader context of the homeland recommendations in the National Commission on the Structure of the Air Force report that the "DoD and the Air Force should treat Homeland Defense and DSCA [Defense

Support to Civil Authorities] as real priorities and Governors as essential stakeholders in planning processes.”

- Maj Gen Edwards then introduced Maj Gen Donald McGregor, Director, National Guard J-5, and the J-5’s homeland planning efforts.
- Maj Gen McGregor, presented information on National Guard Bureau’s Domestic Catastrophes and Integrated Planning effort.
 - He identified the problem statement as limited integration and/or synchronization of state and federal catastrophic planning and further described the National Guard Bureau’s effort to improve the integration and/or synchronization and serve as a “shock absorber” when the next catastrophe hits the United States.
 - GEN Grass noted he briefed National Guard Bureau’s Integrated Planning efforts to Secretary Carter when he was the Deputy Secretary of Defense and one of the first things Secretary Carter asked him after being confirmed as the secretary was about progress with this effort.
 - Maj Gen McGregor displayed the Federal Emergency Management Agency’s data for the cascadian subduction zone earth quake with an associated tsunami to highlight the enormity of the task. He also noted the different approaches to planning with civil authorities, working within the National Response Framework, moving from bottom to top, while the Department of Defense typically plans top to bottom.
 - Maj Gen McGregor then engaged Board Members regarding the efficacy and efficiency of federalizing the response and argued it is better to have federal forces plug into and support civil authorities and emergency managers rather than placing the Department of Defense in charge of the response. As an example, he described the base plans of the fifty-four states and territories as the foundational documents, overlaid with regional and catastrophic incident planning, both civilian and military, and National Guard Bureau efforts to identify gaps and seams between those and federal military planning efforts.
 - Dr. Davidson asked a question regarding whether or not these efforts were tasked in the Guidance for the Employment of the Force and related documents. The answer was that U.S. Northern Command does have taskings to plan for federal military contributions, but the Chief, National Guard Bureau, is not tasked to do the same for non-federalized military forces. However, non-federalized military forces are likely to arrive sooner and be provided in much larger numbers.
 - Dr. Davidson also asked why the planning task had not been added to the Guidance for the Employment of the Force and Maj Gen McGregor replied it is a paradigm shift and that law and policy responsibilities granted to the Chief, National Guard Bureau, as a member of the Joint Chiefs of Staff in 2012, has not been articulated in strategy and the strategic documents.
- The Chairman thanked GEN Grass and Maj Gen McGregor for their work.

0937 - Under Secretary of Defense (Personnel & Readiness), The Honorable Jessica L. Wright, provided remarks

- Ms. Wright explained the congressionally approved Personnel and Readiness reorganization efforts. She expounded that the proposed structure implementation is on hold currently awaiting the Deputy Secretary of Defense’s signature that is expected within the next week. She stated the proposed structure was formed via diverse committees and worked at the lowest levels, to create three Assistant Secretary of Defenses under the Under Secretary of Defense for Personnel and Readiness (P&R): Health Affairs remains intact from the current structure; Manpower and Reserve Affairs (M&RA) looks just like the services M&RA offices that combines what used to

be the Personnel pieces of the previous Readiness and Force Management and Reserve Affairs offices; Readiness is the third ASD created as standalone to highlight the focus this area needs.

- Ms. Wright explained that implementation will be done in phases. During the initial phase there will be a Reserve Integration Cell to address the concern that the focus on reserve issues will be lost once the reorganization is complete. She stated that she believes the structure will focus equally on AC and RC issues. Additionally, she explained that the re-organization now institutes “like functions talking to like functions” and that no jobs are expected to be lost.
- Ms. Wright closed by thanking the Board for their value added efforts and thanked the Chairman for reinvigorating and focusing the board following legislative changes in 2011 that reestablished the Board’s independence.

1000 – Break

1015 – Reserve Forces Policy Board Member, Mr. Sergio A. Pecori, provided Thoughts on the DoD’s Cyber Approach

- Mr. Pecori provided his thoughts and insights into DoD’s cyber efforts and the general cyber environment. He stated that cyber attacks continue to grow unabated and gave examples of some recent effects of cyber attacks in the commercial arena that could possibly affect millions of people. Mr. Pecori restated several reported facts regarding state actors that were of concern and how the DoD should leverage the reserve components to address its cyber professional needs.
- Mr. Pecori also covered how many major North American universities have focused cyber curricula and that these talented people should be the recruiting focus of the reserve components. He also explained some of the issues we currently face in attaining and retaining highly skilled cyber professionals, specifically enlisted personnel, due to the high civilian position demand environment that offers larger salaries and diverse employment options.
- Mr. Pecori addressed how the RCs could support DoD’s efforts, the current state of Reserve cyber units and locations, and the evolution of the cyber mission force implementation planned through 2017. He mentioned recent SecDef statements that focused on the National Guard and Reserves as being a large talent resource pool and approaches the DoD should consider to ensure the Reserve Components are leveraged and fully integrated in the DoD’s cyber capabilities and personnel needs.

1035 – Break

1045 – The Executive Director, Military Compensation and Retirement Modernization Commission (MCRMC), Mr. Robert Daigle, provided remarks

- Mr. Daigle covered the establishment of the commission in the FY 13 NDAA and explained the commission’s purpose and the congressional mandates required within the review that would ensure the long-term viability of the All-Volunteer Force, enable quality of life for members, and modernize and achieve fiscal sustainability.
- Mr. Daigle expounded on the numerous working groups implemented within many organizations and the outreach to and support of many organizations and installations that greatly supported recommendation development. Mr. Daigle further explained the structure the committee used to focus recommendation development centered on the design of the current compensation system and historic proposals or recommendations needed to update the system.
- Mr. Daigle elaborated on the effects on retention, effects on leave and earning statements, and effects on retirement value considering the current retirement plan versus blended retirement plans proposed.

- Mr. Daigle then extensively briefed the board on the commission's 15 specific recommendations and provided personal insights as to how each was developed.

1145 - Break/Transition to Closed Session

1145 – Open Session Closing Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- The Reserve Forces Policy Board concluded the Open Session and moved to Closed Session.

1155 – Closed Session Opening Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- A portion of the meeting was closed to the public from 1155 to 1500.
- The meeting was closed in accordance with provisions outlined by the Government in the Sunshine Act, as amended by 5 U.S.C. § 552b(c)(1) and the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), as amended by 5 U.S.C. Appendix (Executive Order 13526 – Classified National Security Information).
- The agenda items covered during this period were presentations from the Principle Deputy Director, Cost Assessment and Program Evaluation (CAPE); and the Commander, U.S. Northern Command. The unclassified summary of each of the presentations is provided below:

1200 – Remarks by Principal Deputy Director, CAPE: LtGen Robert E. Schmidle, Jr., USMC

- LtGen Schmidle discussed CAPE's role in the PPBE process. Within the PPBE process CAPE develops the fiscal guidance; co-leads the Strategic Portfolio Reviews of initiatives in advanced technologies; and chairs the 3 Star GO programmers meetings prior to a DMAG.
- He outlined FY '16 program priorities: Protect the Homeland, Build Security Globally, Project Power and Win Decisively. The Defense strategy calls for a smaller, leaner force that is agile, technologically advanced, and ready to deploy quickly.
- The Department continues to face hard choices in the FY 2016 President's budget with balancing force structure, modernization, and readiness across the Active and Reserve Force; the return of sequestration will lead to even more difficult choices.

1300 - Break and Lunch

1345 - Remarks by Commander, U.S. Northern Command, ADM William E. Gortney, USN

- ADM Gortney outlined two command priorities: Improving C2 and ensuring the defense of the homeland. One of the biggest threats to the homeland is "Weather of Mass Destruction." He stressed the importance of using the lessons learned from recent hurricanes to improve interagency partnerships and DSCA capabilities.
- ADM Gortney identified NORTHCOM as the DOD advocate for the capabilities needed to protect US interests in the Arctic. Additionally, he discussed the regional partnerships and bilateral command agreements with Canada, Mexico, and the Bahamas.
- He emphasized that the National Guard and Reserves have contributed significantly to NORTHCOM's operational readiness and emphasized the need for predictable RC funding.
- Chairman Punaro thanked Admiral Gortney for taking the time to address the Board and for his support of reserve forces.

1445 – Closed Session Closing Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret)
Arnold Punaro

- Chairman Punaro noted Maj Gen Scott Gorske, Assistant to the Chairman for National Guard Matters, was about to retire and thanked him for his service.
- The Reserve Forces Policy Board concluded business in Closed Session and the meeting was adjourned.



Arnold L. Punaro
Major General, USMCR (Ret)
Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board