



Office of the Secretary of Defense
Reserve Forces Policy Board
Quarterly Meeting Minutes



Wednesday, June 8, 2016

Location of Meeting: Pentagon Room 3E863

Members Present

1. Major General Arnold Punaro, USMCR (Ret) - Chairman
2. Sergeant Major Michael Lewis ARNG - Enlisted Military Advisor to the RFPB (Non-voting) Nominee
3. Mr. Phillip Carter, Senior Fellow, Counsel & Director of the Military, Veterans, and Society Program
4. Vice Admiral John Cotton, USN (Ret)
5. Captain Frances Dawn Halfaker, USA (Ret)
6. Major General Lewis Irwin, USAR
7. Mr. Brett Lambert, Northrop Grumman Corp
8. Rear Admiral Brian LaRoche, USN
9. Major General Walter Lord, ARNG - Military Executive of the Board (Non-voting)
10. Major General Timothy Orr, ARNG
11. Rear Admiral Lower Half Francis Pelkowski, USCGR
12. Lieutenant General Charles Stenner, USAFR (Ret)
13. Ms. MaryAnn Tierney, FEMA Region III
14. Doctor Charlotte Warren, President, Lincoln Land Community College
15. Major General Burke Whitman, USMCR
16. Major General Cornell Wilson, Jr, USMCR (Ret)
17. Major General Sheila Zuehlke, USAFR

Invited Guests

1. Ms. Cathleen Berrick, Managing Director, Defense Capabilities & Management GSA
2. Mr. Dennis Biddick, DASN M&RA/Total Force Integration
3. Mr. Matt Dubois, DASD RA/OASD M&RA
4. The Honorable Eric Fanning, Secretary of the U.S. Army
5. Sergeant Major Terry A. Grezlik, USA, Executive Officer to the Senior Enlisted Advisor to the Joint Chiefs of Staff
6. Dr. Karen Guice, Acting Assistant Secretary of Defense (Health Affairs)
7. Mr. John Hastings, DASD Readiness Programming & Resources/OASD M&RA
8. Major General Gerald W. Ketchum, ARNG, Director of National Guard Joint Staff
9. Lieutenant General Joe Lengyel, ANG, Vice Chief of the National Guard Bureau
10. The Honorable Peter Levine, Acting Under Secretary of Defense for Personnel and Readiness
11. Susan Lucas, Director of Legislative & Military Policy, Reserve Officers Association
12. Mr. Jose Mayorga, Senior Advisor to the Assistant Secretary of Defense for Homeland Defense and Global Security
13. Major General Kevin McNeely, ARNG, Assistant to the CJCS for National Guard & Reserve Matters
14. Megan Myers, Reserve Officers Association
15. Colonel Robert Preiss, ARNG, DASA Training, Readiness, & Mobilization/Alumni
16. Lieutenant Colonel Julie Small, ANG (Ret)
17. The Honorable Todd Weiler, Assistant Secretary of Defense for Manpower and Reserve Affairs
18. Rear Admiral Linda Wackerman, USN, OPNAV N81R (Nominated Board Member)

Institute of Defense Analyses (IDA)

1. Joseph Adams
2. Amy Alrich

RFPB Staff

1. Captain Jay Gagne, USN, Chief of Staff
2. Mr. Alexander Sabol, DoD Civilian (Designated Federal Officer)
3. Lieutenant Colonel Matt Groves, ANG
4. Colonel Bill Hersh, ARNG
5. Colonel Kevin Merrill, USAFR
6. Lieutenant James McKnight, USCGR
7. Colonel Bart Pester, USMCR
8. Sergeant First Class India Boddie, ARNG
9. Ms. Cindy Tyrie, Administrative Assistant

RFPB Consultants

1. Colonel Mark Cancian, USMCR (Ret)
2. Captain Austin Murnane, USMCR, Nominee

RFPB Fellows Society/Alumni

1. Major General Larry Taylor, USMC (Ret)

Other Guests

1. Colonel George Barido, USA, OASD HA/HA, RC Medical Programs
2. Colonel Terence Breelenkamp, USAR, Executive Secretary, ASD M&RA
3. Brigadier General Jeffery Cashman, ANG-A1
4. Ms. Kate Charlet, OSD Policy
5. Lieutenant Colonel Brett Criqui, ARNG
6. Colonel Kristen Dixon, USAR, PAO ASD M&RA
7. Sergeant Sherrod Percell, USA, Army Audio Visual Team
8. Brigadier General Craig LaFave, USAFR TF-C
9. Ms. Chris Lundquist, OASD HA/DHA
10. First Lieutenant John McElligott, USAR, Co-Chair, TMC Guard/Reserve Committee
11. Colonel Robert Myles, USA, Senior Military Advisor, OUSD P&R
12. Major General Pat Murphy, ARNG, NGB J5
13. Specialist Tammy Nooner, USA, Army Photographer
14. Mr. Mike Petrie, NGB-J5
15. Major Amiela Seymanski, USMCR, MARFORES
16. Major General Robert Shannon, ANG ARFPC
17. Mr. Scott Sharp, Strategic Planner NGB-RMA (PA&E)
18. Colonel Martha Vanddriel, PCA Office, OSD
19. Commander Angela Webster, USN, Military Assistant ASD HA
20. Specialist Jeremy Yu, USA, Army Audio Visual Team

**** Closed - Board Administrative Time****

The Reserve Forces Policy Board (RFPB) held a quarterly meeting in the Pentagon, Washington, DC on June 8, 2016 in Room 3E863.

0830 – Chairman Punaro administratively opened the Board to conduct required administrative business.

0845 – Military Executive provided additional administrative announcements to the Board.

0850 – Chairman Punaro presided over an awards ceremony for departing Board member RADM Brian LaRoche, USN.

****Start of Closed Meeting****

****Closed Meeting due to Classified Content****

0900 – Closed Session Opening Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- The Chairman announced this portion of the meeting was closed to the public from 9:00 a.m. to 12:30 p.m.
- The meeting was closed in accordance with provisions outlined by the Government in the Sunshine Act, as amended by 5 U.S.C. § 552b(c)(1) and the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), as amended by 5 U.S.C. Appendix (Executive Order 13526 – Classified National Security Information).
- The Chairman called the meeting to order and announced, as required by the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), that the Designated Federal Officer was present and had pre-approved the opening of the meeting and the agenda.

0910 – SGM Terry A. Grezlik, Executive Officer to the Senior Enlisted Advisor to the Joint Chiefs of Staff

- SGM Grezlik provided his career history as an anecdotal example of expertise and diversity of experience brought to the force by today's enlisted active and reserve component members.
- He discussed the role of the SEA as the voice of the joint enlisted force, and provided examples of the enlisted perspective to the board.
- He provided his thoughts on the greatest concerns of enlisted members, stating he is most often asked about the future of medical care and retirement.
- SGM Grezlik emphasized the importance of proactively and persistently communicating changes and subsequent impacts across all levels of military personnel.

0950 – Break

1000 – The Honorable Eric Fanning, Secretary of the Army

- Sec Fanning discussed the total force perspective of the Army, increasing integration between components, and smarter ways of recruiting, retaining, and employing the force.
- He stated when the Army meets future end strength numbers, 54% of the force will reside in the Reserve Component.
- He noted reserve soldiers want to deploy, and that the Army is increasingly involving state Adjutants General in decision making processes.
- He cautioned that increasing communications is not the sole solution, and emphasized the importance of honesty, especially as we cast aside old concepts and begin stress-testing total force integration.
- Sec Fanning discussed ongoing assessments of recruiting efforts, stating we can actually recruit fewer personnel but maintain greater numbers if we can target the right people, who will not attrite out and will likely stay beyond their initial enlistment period.

1040 – Break

1050 – The Honorable Peter Levine, Acting Under Secretary of Defense for Personnel and Readiness

- Sec Levine summarized actions accomplished since his April appointment as Acting USD P&R, highlighting upcoming announcements of additional Force of the Future initiatives as well as the department's review of Goldwater-Nichols and joint officer qualifications.
- He described three targeted legislative proposals; voluntary opt-out of promotion cycle, enhanced lateral entry for hard to recruit/train career fields, and lineal number adjustment authority.
- He stated that generally, he is analyzing needs for deviation from normal personnel systems, and would like to see overarching authorization for services to identify critical career fields for specific capability to build capacity.
- He discussed civilian hiring, noting civil service should be offered to military academy graduates unable to serve militarily as an alternative, and added that he would like to see a civilian direct hiring authority for recent graduates, as opposed to the current system which requires application and processing through the Office of Personnel Management USAJOBS system.
- Sec Levine briefly addressed the ASD Reserve Affairs reorganization, stating the department will need to continue to monitor and assess the effectiveness of these changes, to ensure the specific expertise needed to address unique reserve component issues is not lost.

1140 – Break

****Start of Open Meeting****
(Unclassified)

1230 – Opening Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board – MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro.

- The Chairman called the meeting to order and announced, as required by the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), that the Designated Federal Officer was present and had pre-approved the opening of the meeting and the agenda.
- The Chairman announced the meeting was open to the public and noted no persons had submitted requests to appear before the Board. The Chairman asked if anyone present wished to address the Board and no one indicated a desire to do so.

1235 – The Honorable Todd Weiler, Assistant Secretary of Defense for Manpower and Reserve Affairs

- Sec Weiler stated his goal was to parallel the structure of service Manpower and Reserve Affairs offices in his organization, but while eliminating barriers due to cultural differences.
- He discussed reserve component duty status reform, noting this was an opportunity for significant change, but added changes must be accomplished with consideration so that the end result is good, and not just fast.
- He noted the need to ensure recent accomplishments are not lost in the upcoming transition of administrations, especially ideas and concepts in some stage of development that have not yet been implemented.
- He addressed demographics of the all-volunteer force, noting how better permeability between the components could help in reversing troubling trends.
- Sec Weiler suggested that as the services improve permeability between components, we will see an increase in diversity among recruits.

1320 – Break

1330 – Mr. Joseph Adams, Institute for Defense Analyses

- Mr. Adams provided a brief review of previously presented findings on IDA's study of RC performance during Operation Iraqi Freedom, and then detailed subsequent actions including testing of methods of analysis for accuracy and briefings to reserve component chiefs.
- He stated the data continues to indicate no significant differences in combat performance between components of a service, and overall operations were characterized by a shared risk and shared burden.
- He noted performance data was not readily captured, and that only available data could be analyzed, but discussed the quantitative sources used, as well as the numerous anecdotal interviews that were converted into measurable data.
- Mr. Adams concluded with a summary of remaining tasks, an estimated time of completion, and a brief overview of the next part of the study covering Operation Enduring Freedom.

1410 – Subcommittee Updates

1410 – Personnel Subcommittee Lt Gen Charles Stenner, USAFRN (Ret), Subcommittee Chair

- Lt Gen Stenner reviewed key personnel changeover within OSD since the last RFPB meeting, including Sec Levine and Sec Weiler.
- He provided an update on the Personnel Subcommittee's monitoring of the Force of the Future initiative, noting Sec Levine's focus on what is most important, and what can reasonably be accomplished in this administration's remaining time.
- He discussed the Personnel Subcommittee's continuing interest in Force of the Future, Blended Retirement, Duty Status Reform, Military Technician Reduction/Conversion, and Post-9/11 GI Bill Entitlements for Full Time National Guard Duty.
- He presented a brief update and current status on each of these topics.
- Lt Gen Stenner concluded by stating that the Personnel Subcommittee would continue to work with OSD and the Services to determine potential Reserve Component impacts, while increasing collaboration with service-specific policy committees and boards on relevant issues.

1430 – Homeland Subcommittee MG Tim Orr, USA, Subcommittee Chair

- MG Orr invited Mr. Jose Mayorga, Senior Advisor to the Assistant Secretary of Defense for Homeland Defense and Global Security, to discuss the unique aspects and qualities of domestic cyber defense operations.
- Mr. Mayorga discussed focusing on cyber activities in the homeland, integration of the reserve component into the cyber mission force, and development of the cyber policy memo signed in May, 2016.
- He analyzed one of the primary questions identified concerning the use of the reserve component in homeland cyber operations, asking what can reserve component forces do under the context of total force training that can benefit a third party.
- He expanded on the limitations required to function within these parameters, stating operations could not be offensive, could not provide assistance to law enforcement, and would be limited to protecting DoD infrastructure, enhancing situational awareness, and restricted to the Secret level or below unless expressly approved by SECDEF.
- He provided a brief overview of DoD homeland cyber assets, to include Army National Guard Cyber Protection Teams, and Air National Guard Cyber Protection Squadrons.
- Mr. Mayorga noted differences in the services' approach to cyber force reserve component integration, stating the Air Force designed organizations from the outset to be total force, while the Army generally regards the reserve component as a surge force in cyber.

1510 – Operational Reserve Subcommittee VADM John Cotton, USN (Ret), Subcommittee Chair

- VADM Cotton provided a brief update on the RFPB recommendation of a definition for “Operational Reserve,” and then introduced Dr. Karen Guice, Acting Secretary of Defense (Health Affairs) to discuss medical readiness and observable disparities between services and components within services.
- Dr. Guice addressed a 2012 RAND study recommending standardization/optimization of physical health assessments, as well as standardization of data collection and measurement.
- She provided a review of DoD policy, noting six criteria of readiness and four ratings of medical readiness, but noted that the different ratings mean different things to different services.
- She observed that standardization is improving, which in turn is improving lack of readiness due to administrative issues, but then questioned whether or not the 85% standard was sufficient or if it should be raised.
- Dr. Guice discussed initiatives to increase and expand the range of medical health care providers, such as finding a way to credential and certify combat medics, and expanded use of telemedicine.

1600 – Chairman’s Time – MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- Chairman Punaro discussed Senate Armed Services Committee provisions on General and Flag Officers contained in S. 2943, the 2017 National Defense Authorization Act, and proposed the three RFPB subcommittee chairs look at how streamlining could be accomplished without adversely influencing reserve component representation at the most senior levels.
- Chairman Punaro then introduced MajGen Burke Whitman, RFPB Member, to provide an update on the New Administration Transition Book, with a current list of issues intended for inclusion. MajGen Whitman asked the board for additional issues to be considered, and the following issues were recommended for addition:
 - General Officer/Flag Officer numbers and distribution
 - Reserve Component integration in cyber missions
 - Reserve Component/Active Component cost comparison update
 - Reserve Component Medical Readiness
 - Installation and infrastructure reduction
 - Myths about the Reserve Component and Accessibility
- Chairman Punaro then introduced Mr. Mark Cancian, RFPB Consultant, to address Goldwater-Nichols reform efforts and current defense budget information.
- Mr. Cancian provided a summary of congressional proposals to address issues targeted by the original Goldwater-Nichols legislation.
- He provided a review of the original legislation and the rationale, conditions, and interests behind it.
- He noted that both the House and Senate versions of the 2017 NDAA with provisions to reform Goldwater-Nichols have been threatened with a presidential veto, though due to different controversial proposals in each version.
- He observed the majority of proposed reforms address the following organizations/areas:
 - Size/makeup of the National Security Council
 - DoD Acquisition
 - Reduction of General/Flag officers
 - DoD Infrastructure
 - Combatant Command structure and composition
 - Joint Staff structure and composition
 - Other DoD organizational issues
- Mr. Cancian pointed out that none of the reform proposals are really designed or intended to save money.

1710 – Reserve Forces Policy Board Military Executive Closing Remarks Major General Walter Lord,
ARNG, RFPB Military Executive

1715 – Closing Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- Chairman Punaro thanked all in attendance for their support of the RFPB and the men and women of the Reserve Components.
- The Reserve Forces Policy Board concluded business, and the meeting was adjourned.

****End of Open Meeting****

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Arnold Punaro', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Arnold L. Punaro
Major General, USMCR (Ret)
Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board