



Office of the Secretary of Defense
Reserve Forces Policy Board
Quarterly Meeting Minutes
Tuesday, 9 December, 2014
Location of Meeting: Pentagon Room 3E863



Members Present

1. MajGen Arnold Punaro, USMCR (Ret) - Chairman
2. MG Marcia Anderson, USAR - Deputy Chief Army Reserve (IMA)
3. SGM Michael Biere, USAR - Enlisted Military Advisor to the Reserve Forces Policy Board (Non-voting)
4. VADM John Cotton, USN (Ret)
5. Maj Gen H. Michael Edwards, ANG - The Adjutant General of Colorado
6. The Honorable Grier Martin, Member North Carolina House of Representatives
7. Ms. Dawn Halfaker, Captain, USA (Ret)
8. RADM Brian LaRoche, USN
9. MG William Wofford, ARNG, The Adjutant General of Arkansas
10. Mr. Sergio Pecori - President & Chief Executive Officer of Hanson Professional Services Inc.
11. RADM Kurt Hinrichs, USCGR
12. Dr. John Nagl, Headmaster, the Haverford School
13. BG Walter Lord, ARNG - Military Executive of the Board (Non-voting)

Invited Guests

1. LTG David W. Barno, USA (Ret), Senior Fellow & Co-Director of the Responsible Defense Program, the Center for a New American Security (CNAS)
2. Mr. Timothy Bonds, Vice President, RAND Army Research Division and Director, RAND Arroyo Center
3. Dr. Janine Davidson, Senior Fellow for Defense Policy at Council on Foreign Relations
4. MG Scott Gorske, ARNG, Assistant to CJCS for National Guard Matters
5. General John F. Kelly, USMC, Commander, U.S. Southern Command (By VTC)
6. Mr. Josh Klimas, RAND Arroyo Center
7. Mr. David LaCroix, SOCO General Council
8. Mr. Raymond F. Rees, DASA (M&RA)
9. Mr. Al Robbert, RAND Arroyo Center
10. Ms. MaryAnn Tierney, Regional Administrator for FEMA Region III
11. MajGen William Waldrop, Assistant to the CJCS for Reserve Matters
12. MajGen Cornell Wilson, I, USMCR (Ret), Military Advisor, Governor of North Carolina

RFPB Staff

1. Col Jay Jensen, USAFR
2. Mr. Alexander Sabol, DoD Civilian (DFO)
3. CAPT Jay Gagne, USNR
4. Col Reidar Larsen, USMCR
5. COL Timothy Lynch, USAR
6. LTC Brad Martsching, ARNG
7. Lt Col Troy Pou, ANG
8. LT Todd Smith, USCGR

9. SMSgt Joyce Voyles, USAFR
10. SFC India Boddie, ARNG
11. Ms. Cindy Tyrie, DoD Contractor

Public Observers

1. CAPT Robert Bennett, USN, DASN (M&RA)
2. CDR (Ret) René Campos
3. COL Tim Connelly, OASA (M&RA)
4. Maj Gen Garry Dean, CNGB Representative
5. Mr. Justin Doubleday, Inside the Army Reporter
6. Mr. Bob Fiedler, ROA
7. LTC Eric Givens, OCAR
8. CDR Gwen Groves, DASN M&RA
9. Mr. Jerome Howard, WHS Photographer
10. LTC George Lewis, NGRM
11. CAPT David Opatz, Director Readiness, OASD (RA)
12. CPT Rhonda Powell, OCAR

0800 – Chairman Punaro administratively opened the Board to conduct required administrative business.

- The Chairman welcomed members and staff and noted that this was RADM Kurt Hinrichs first meeting as a member and BG Walter Lord’s first meeting as the Board’s Military Executive.
- The Chairman also welcomed nominated members Ms. Janine Davidson, LTG (Ret) David Barno, Ms. MaryAnn Tierney, and MajGen (Ret) Cornell Wilson.

0802 - Military Executive provided additional administrative announcements to the Board.

- Provided administrative announcements.
- Reminded members and guests to leave electronic devices outside the room and turn them off.

0805 - Chairman Punaro presided over an awards ceremony for departing Board member MG William Wofford.

0810 - Chairman Punaro administered the oath to RADM Hinrichs and BG Lord.

0815 - Ethics Brief with Question & Answer period - Mr. David LaCroix, Standards of Conduct Office DoD Office of General Counsel

- Mr. LaCroix presented the Ethics for Federal Advisory Committee Members brief, an annual requirement.
- Mr. LaCroix focused on Special Government Employees and ethics rules applicable to members and the DFO and concluded after answering several questions.
- Chairman Punaro thanked Mr. LaCroix for his sustained support and urged members to contact the DoD Standards of Conduct Office if or when they have questions.

0840 - Opening Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- The Chairman called the meeting to order and announced, as required by the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), the Designated Federal Officer is present and has pre-approved the opening of this meeting and its agenda.
- The Chairman announced the meeting was open to the public and noted that no persons had submitted requests to appear before the Board. The Chairman asked if anyone present wished to address the Board and no one indicated a desire to do so.

0845 - Subcommittee Updates

- MG Marcia Anderson, Subcommittee Chair, provided an update from the Subcommittee on Supporting and Sustaining Reserve Component Personnel.
 - MG Anderson updated members on a July 2013 RFPB recommendation and current USD (P&R) proposal to reduce the total number of reserve duty statuses and noted that P&R has completed a draft proposal required by Congress no later than 1 January 2015. The proposal is expected to mirror the 11th Quadrennial Review of Military Compensation.
 - MG Anderson provided an update to the RFPB's recommendation that SECDEF approve a pending Unified Legislation and Budgeting proposal which would add Title 10 12301(h) (i.e. medical hold) as a period of "active duty" under Title 38, Section 3301 (1)(B) for the purpose of accruing Post-9/11 GI Bill benefits. The proposal was approved for submission to OMB on October 29, 2014, subject to confirmation by USD (P&R) that the purpose of the proposal is parity between active duty and reserve personnel and does not require DoD funding.
 - MG Anderson provided an update regarding recent subcommittee activities and current focus.
 - On November 13th, the subcommittee met with Mr. Jason Forrester, Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense (DASD) for Reserve Affairs (Manpower and Personnel), regarding current M&P initiatives. Topics discussed included: issues in attraction and transfer of talent from AC to RC, health of the RC, disability overpayment issues, and several additional efforts to increase language, cultural and other skills in the RC and the need for cyber professionals in the DOD Cyber Enterprise.
 - MG Anderson explained that the subcommittee is investigating the past use, management and future plans for the Individual Ready Reserve (IRR) across the different services. There is a need to analyze and develop future plans for the IRR and maximize its use to mitigate budget impacts on the total force as the United States moves forward in an era with significantly constrained resources.
 - Discussion turned to a claim that 25% of reservists do not have health insurance and that increased use of TRICARE Select can assist in reducing these numbers. VADM Cotton mentioned that dental plans are also underutilized and there are numerous "ghost" reservists who may be contributing to inaccurate numbers of the non-insured. It was also mentioned that RC members lose TRICARE Select when they are forced out of the reserves due to force reductions, etc. Regarding the IRR, MG Anderson mentioned recent changes to policy which included the cancellation of annual IRR conferences. She also mentioned the recent increase in the Army's IRR personnel from 70,000 to nearly 100,000 and its lack of readiness. She concluded that it is time to "re-imagine" the IRR. Chairman Punaro agreed that the IRR had been neglected and plans for future use and improved effectiveness should be developed.
- VADM (Ret) John Cotton, Subcommittee Chair, provided an update from the Subcommittee on Ensuring a Ready, Capable, Available and Sustainable Operational Reserve.
 - VADM Cotton reminded members that at the Board's September 2014 meeting, BG Fountain, on behalf of the Director, Army National Guard, questioned the continued use of assumptions like those found in the December 2007 "Utilization of the Total Force" policy memo and the use of those assumptions, by the Services, in determining or influencing AC/RC force mix.

- VADM Cotton also noted that in 2013, the Chief of the National Guard Bureau, in letters to the Chiefs of Staff of the Army and Air Force, offered that “two-year notice, nine-months boots on the ground, 30-day individual notice, not more than 50 percent of a state’s force structure deployed at once and other policies were helpful over the last decade, but they should not govern force planning assumptions for future contingencies.”
- VADM Cotton proposed that the Board examine what assumptions the Services use in making force size and AC/RC mix decisions.
- Several members expressed doubt that the Department’s 1:5 Mobilization to Dwell rotational use ratio is appropriate in planning for the future use of the National Guard and Reserve.
- A number of members expressed support for a review.
- The Chairman concurred and tasked the subcommittee with developing the framework for such an examination.
- Maj Gen Edwards, Subcommittee Chair, provided an update from the Subcommittee on Enhancing DoD’s Role in the Homeland. Maj Gen Edwards noted continued work on funding for National Special Security Events and that the subcommittee would be shadowing Ohio as they prepare an upcoming nominating convention.
- The Chairman thanked the Subcommittees for their work.

0915 - Junior Officer Panel Readout - Ms. Dawn Halfaker, Operational Reserve Subcommittee Member, provided a read-out from panels conducted with Reserve Component Junior Officers.

- Ms. Halfaker reminded members that her presentation built on two prior RFPB Operational Reserve Subcommittee briefings (March and June 2014) that examined data from the Defense Manpower Data Center and its Status of Forces Survey of the Reserve Components over the period 2001 to 2013.
- She noted that to further refine our understanding of observations made in the previous efforts, we conducted small group discussions with 3 panels of company grade officers and 1 panel of field grade officers from across the Reserve Components.
- Ms. Halfaker offered that discussions with our panelists validated general observations made in prior efforts, specifically that: all of the panelist expressed satisfaction with the Military Way of Life and most perceived their families and employers support their participation in the Reserve Components; all of the panelist expressed an intent to continue serving; and virtually all of the panelists support recurring use of the Reserve Components and are willing to serve in support of a wide variety of missions at home and abroad.
- She also reported that the panelists were: acutely aware of the pressure on the Department’s budget; hugely frustrated with access to DoD automation systems and networks; very concerned with increases in administrative and general military training requirements; and concerned with the readiness and retention impacts of these and other challenges.
- She offered the following topics/issues for further Board examination:
 - The funding profile for Reserve Component training
 - Policies governing General Military Training/Ancillary Training
 - Policies governing Reserve Component access to DoD networks
 - Mental Health treatment options for Reservists
 - Trends in employment/Uniformed Services Employment and Reemployment Rights Act (USERRA) issues
- The Chairman thanked Ms. Halfaker for her valuable work and asked her to conduct similar periodic reviews with Reserve Component junior officers in the future. The Chairman further directed that the Board look into general military training requirements and policies governing Reserve Component access to DoD networks.

0950 – Open Session Closing Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- Chairman Punaro thanked the Subcommittee Chairs and Ms. Halfaker for their updates.
- The Reserve Forces Policy Board concluded the Open Session and moved to Closed Session.

1000 – Closed Session Opening Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- A portion of the meeting was closed to the public from 9:55 p.m. to 2:30 p.m.
- The meeting was closed in accordance with provisions outlined by the Government in the Sunshine Act, as amended by 5 U.S.C. § 552b(c)(1) and the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), as amended by 5 U.S.C. Appendix (Executive Order 13526 – Classified National Security Information).
- The agenda items covered during this period were presentations from the following speakers: U.S. Southern Command; Vice President, RAND Army Research Division and Director, RAND Arroyo, and MajGen Arnold Punaro, USMC (Ret). The unclassified summary of each of the presentations is provided below:

1005 – Vice President, RAND Army Research Division and Director, RAND Arroyo - Mr. Timothy M. Bonds with Mr. Josh Klimas and Mr. Al Robbert

- Mr. Bonds introduced himself and conducted a preliminary introduction of two recent RAND reports - “Assessing the Army's Active-Reserve Component Force Mix” and “Air Force Manpower Requirements and Component Mix.”
- Mr. Bonds also discussed how they planned to address Active Component/Reserve Component cost, force mix, and use to address national security challenges in a fiscally constrained environment.
- He concluded by introducing Mr. Josh Klimas and Mr. Al Robbert, the reports lead authors.
- Mr. Klimas, “Assessing the Army's Active-Reserve Component Force Mix,” stated that budget reductions and new defense strategic guidance are causing the Army to reassess how it balances the mix of forces between its active and reserve components (AC/RC).
- Mr. Klimas noted the study was sponsored by Headquarters, Department of the Army, (HQDA) G-8 and that this report describes analyses from an ongoing stream of RAND research on the Army's AC/RC force mix. He also noted his study used HQDA cost data, not their own analysis.
- Mr. Klimas believes that multiple factors should influence the Army AC-RC force mix decisions, including the capabilities that AC and RC forces provide and their cost. The key findings of his report are:
 - Force mix decisions must account for differences in the capabilities that Active and Reserve Components provide, as well as differences in cost.
 - Policymakers should consider both capability and cost as they weigh force mix decisions.
 - While a need to surge forces for potential future major combat operations may once again drive total Army force size decisions, the mix of forces required for sustained operations and the relative cost of AC and RC forces in providing sustained output remain relevant planning considerations.
- Mr. Robbert, “Air Force Manpower Requirements and Component Mix: A Focus on Agile Combat Support,” stated that the report explored policies regarding manpower and personnel

requirements processes. Since some requirements are based on wartime or deployment needs rather than peacetime or garrison needs, RAND sought to determine if a common-sight picture of wartime demands was available.

- Mr. Robbert stated that he found that manpower processes differ across components, functional areas (operations, maintenance, and combat support), and workforces (active military, active Guard/Reserve [AGR], air reserve technician [ART], dual-status technician [ANG equivalent of the AFR's ART], traditional part-time reservist/guardsman [TR], individual mobilization augmentee [IMA], civilian, and contractor).
- Mr. Robbert concluded by recommending a broader manpower requirements processes, but focuses most heavily on AC/RC interfaces and the determination of wartime requirements.

1140 - Break and Lunch

1205 - Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- Chairman Punaro began by noting that his presentation represented his individual views and opinions not those of the RFPB. He then provided the RFPB his personal perspective and analysis on the effect that the newly elected Congress and appointment of The Honorable Ashton B. Carter as the new Secretary of Defense will have on the readiness, availability, and future use of the National Guard and Reserve.
- Chairman Punaro also gave an overview and specifics of the FY16 NDAA Amendment: Report True Cost of Manpower with the proposed bill that amends 10 USC § 115a, the section of law that directs the annual *Defense Manpower Requirements Report*.

1305 - Break

1315 - Remarks by Commander, U.S. Southern Command - Gen John F. Kelly, USMC (via Secure VTC)

- Gen Kelly started his brief by stating that he has had an outstanding experience with working with the National Guard and Reserves and gained respect for them during his command tours in Iraq and Afghanistan, his command of Marine Forces Reserve, and in his current position as Commander, U.S. Southern Command. He also noted that some senior leaders have a weak understanding of what the Reserve Components can provide.
- Gen Kelly praised the Reserve Components' service in Iraq and Afghanistan, their demonstrated military professionalism, and usefulness of their civilian experience.
- He cited one example of his command experience in theater during which he facilitated establishment and training of local community police forces by embedding them with Marine Corps Reservist who had police force experience from their civilian capacity.
- He further stated that he was able to establish local community commerce and economic programs by using a Marine Reservists who had business and financial experience.
- Gen Kelly concluded by emphasizing that the National Guard and Reserves have contributed significantly to the U.S. Southern Command's operational mission, that they are ready, relevant, and responsive to his needs and requirements.
- Chairman Punaro thanked Gen Kelly for taking the time to address the Board and his support of reserve forces during his career.

1425 - The Reserve Forces Policy Board concluded business in Closed Session and the meeting was adjourned.



Arnold L. Punaro
Major General, USMCR (Ret)
Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board