



**Office of the Secretary of Defense  
Reserve Forces Policy Board**

***Quarterly Meeting Minutes***

**Wednesday, December 8, 2015**

**Location of Meeting: Pentagon Room 3E863**



**Members Present**

1. Major General Arnold Punaro, USMCR (Ret) - Chairman
2. Lieutenant General David Barno, USA (Ret), Distinguished Practitioner in Residence, American University's School of International Service (SIS ) Faculty
3. Sergeant Major Michael Biere, USAR - Enlisted Military Advisor to the RFPB (Non-voting)
4. VADM John Cotton, USN (Ret)
5. Doctor Janine Davidson, Senior Fellow for Defense Policy at Council on Foreign Relations
6. Major General Lewis Irwin, USAR
7. Rear Admiral Brian LaRoche, USN
8. Major General Walter Lord, ARNG - Military Executive of the Board (Non-voting)
9. Doctor John Nagl, Headmaster, The Haverford School
10. MG Timothy Orr, ARNG
11. Maj Gen Scott Rice, ANG
12. Lieutenant General Jimmy Sherrard, USAFR (Ret)
13. Ms. MaryAnn Tierney, FEMA Region III
14. Major General Burke Whitman, USMCR
15. Major General (Ret) Cornell Wilson, Jr, USMCR

**Invited Guests**

1. Doctor Nora Bensahel, Distinguished Practitioner in Residence, American University's School of International Service (SIS ) Faculty
2. Mr. Matt Dubois, DASD RA/OASD M&RA
3. Ms. Mackenzie Eaglen, American Enterprise Institute
4. General Frank Grass, ARNG, Chief, National Guard Bureau
5. Mr. John Hastings, DASD Readiness Programming & Resources/OASD M&RA
6. Lieutenant Colonel Matt Groves, ANG
7. The Honorable Kathleen Hicks, Center for Strategic & International Studies
8. Brigadier General Tim Hilty, ARNG, Pennsylvania National Guard
9. MG Kevin McNeely, ARNG, Assistant to the CJCS for National Guard & Reserve Matters
10. General Mark Milley, USA. Chief of Staff, Army
11. Mr. Dave LaCroix, Standards of Conduct Office/OGC
12. COL Robert Preiss, ARNG, DASA Training, Readiness, & Mobilization
13. Mr. Raymond Rees, Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Army, Manpower & Reserve Affairs
14. MG Michael Smith, USAR, Deputy Chief, Army Reserve
15. Lt Gen Charles Stenner, USAFR (Ret)
16. Major General William Waldrop, USAFR, Assistant to the CJCS for National Guard & Reserve Matters
17. Doctor Jill Warren, President, Lincoln Land Community College (LLCC)
18. Major General Sheila Zuehlke, USAFR

**Institute of Defense Analyses (IDA)**

1. Joseph Adams
2. Amy Alrich

3. Lance Hancock
4. Peter Picucci
5. Richard Poulin
6. Jenns Robertson

#### **RFPB Staff**

1. Colonel Timothy Lynch, USAR, Chief of Staff
2. Mr. Alexander Sabol, DoD Civilian (Designated Federal Officer)
3. Col Mark Cancian, USMCR (Ret) RFPB Consultant
4. Colonel Ty Clifton, USAR
5. Captain Jay Gagne, USN
6. Colonel Bill Hersh, ARNG
7. Colonel Jay Jensen, USAFR
8. Lieutenant James McKnight, USCGR
9. Colonel Bart Pester, USMCR
10. Sergeant First Class India Boddie, ARNG
11. Ms. Cindy Tyrie, Administrative Assistant

#### **RFPB Fellows Society/Alumni**

1. Major General Larry Taylor, USMC (Ret)

\*\* Closed - Board Administrative Time\*\*

The Reserve Forces Policy Board (RFPB) held a quarterly meeting in the Pentagon, Washington, DC on December 8, 2015 in Room 3E863.

0820 – Chairman Punaro administratively opened the Board to conduct required administrative business.

- The Chairman welcomed members, staff, and invited guest and noted that he would swear in members later in the meeting.
- The Chairman welcomed new members: Mr. Carter, MG Irwin, MG Orr, and Maj Gen Rice; and nominees: Dr. Charlotte Warren, Maj Gen Sheila Zuehlke, and Nora Bensahel, as well as, Brett Lambert, who was unable to attend.
- The Chairman then recognized Mr. Jerome Howard from the Army Photography Division, who will be retiring from government service next month.

0825 – Military Executive provided additional administrative announcements to the Board.

0830 – Chairman Punaro administered the oath to the new Board members – Lt Gen (Ret) Charlie Stenner, MG Tim Orr, Maj Gen Scott Rice, MG Lewis Irwin, and Mr. Phil Carter.

0835 – Chairman Punaro presided over an awards ceremony for departing Board members Dr. John Nagl and Lt Gen (Ret) James E. Sherrard III.

0840 – Mr. David LaCroix, Standards of Conduct Office DoD Office of General Counsel presented the Ethics for Federal Advisory Committee Members brief, an annual requirement.

0910 – Chairman Punaro made additional comments.



- Chairman Punaro introduced Dr. Nora Bensahel and Phil Cater. Dr. Bensahel discussed Force of the Future (FotF), ways to keep 'talent,' and the first steps towards FotF. Mr. Carter discussed issues with recruiting and retention data collection, costs expenditures in health care, the loss of intellectual property, and the demographics of new recruits into the services. LTG Barno added that the services don't have mechanisms in place to tell what happens when we lose 'talent.'
- Chairman Punaro noted that he continued to hear requests for a "Reagan Era" budget but noted when adjusted for inflation we currently have the Reagan Era budget, but due to increasing costs, the size of the Force is dramatically smaller than 30 years ago.
- Chairman Punaro introduced GEN Grass, Chief of the National Guard Bureau. GEN Grass discussed his recent trips to Kosovo, Afghanistan, and Romania. A consistent theme throughout his trip was, "Can't tell the difference" between AC and RC Soldiers.

\*\*Start of Closed Meeting\*\*

\*\*Closed Meeting due to Classified Content\*\*

0920 – Closed Session Opening Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- The Chairman announced this portion of the meeting was closed to the public from 9:20 a.m. to 12:30 p.m.
- The meeting was closed in accordance with provisions outlined by the Government in the Sunshine Act, as amended by 5 U.S.C. § 552b(c)(1) and the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), as amended by 5 U.S.C. Appendix (Executive Order 13526 – Classified National Security Information).
- The agenda items covered during this period were presentations from the following speakers: Institute for Defense Analyses, Joe Adams and the Chief of Staff, US Army, Gen Mark Milley. The unclassified summary of each of the presentations is provided below:
- The Chairman called the meeting to order and announced, as required by the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), that the Designated Federal Officer was present and had pre-approved the opening of the meeting and the agenda.

0930 – Joe Adams, Institute for Defense Analyses, provided an update on a study of RC performance during Operation Iraqi Freedom.

- Mr. Adams provided background on how the study was being conducted. He reviewed personnel contributions by service, SIGACTS, THOR Aviation Database input, mission and performance assessments, lesson learned, transcripts, and interviews, and briefly commented on forthcoming engagements and obstacles and challenges related to the study.
- Dr. Nagl, LTG Barno, and Dr. Davidson mentioned 3 key takeaways from the IDA update:
  - 1) There was a shared burden between AC and RC
  - 2) There was a shared risk between AC and RC
  - 3) There were similar results between AC and RC
- Dr. Nagl recommended these key takeaways are used for the title of the study – "Shared Burden, Shared Risk, and Similar Results."

1120 – Break

1130 – GEN Mark Milley, USA, Chief of Staff, Army

- GEN Milley outlined the "World according to Milley" and provided insights about how he plans to get the Army ready as a service and as a vital component of the Joint force.
- He described geostrategic challenges in the Middle East, Europe, Asia and Regional/Global Terrorism and how the Army is adapting to meet current and future threats.
- He emphasized his goals regarding Reserve Component (RC) utilization in the current training spectrum and how he plans to keep them relevant going forward. GEN Milley expressed concern with the number of RC training days saying, "39 days is not enough."
- GEN Milley also talked about Cyber security and the role the Army and the Reserve Component could provide to the Department of Defense.

1230 – Break

\*\*Start of Open Meeting\*\*  
(Unclassified)

1245 – Opening Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board – MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro.

- The Chairman announced the meeting was open to the public and noted no persons had submitted requests to appear before the Board. The Chairman asked if anyone present wished to address the Board and no one indicated a desire to do so.

1300 – The Honorable Kathleen Hicks, Center for Strategic and International Studies

- Ms. Hicks outlined key challenges in the international security environment and the implications for U.S. National Security strategy.
- She described the following five insights that should help guide policymakers devising a National Security strategy: Changing power dynamics, enduring U.S. support for engagement, the reality of selective engagement, the importance of preventative approaches and challenges to deterrence.

1340 – Break

1345 – Ms. Mackenzie Eaglen, American Enterprise Institute

- Ms. Eaglen provided her perspectives on key defense policy challenges, the politics of defense, and the resourcing of national security requirements.
- She discussed the defense drawdown and the Budget Control Act; the limits of defense reform; the lack of understanding of the compounding effects of the BCA and the preceding defense budget reductions; and domestic political constraints on defense spending and defense programs.

1425 – Break

1430 – Subcommittee Updates

1430 – Operational Reserve Subcommittee Vice Admiral John Cotton, USN (Ret), Subcommittee Chair



- Admiral Cotton discussed the subcommittee examination of RC availability and access policy.
- The Subcommittee is also evaluating the appropriateness of: Continued Use of the RC, AC/RC force size and mix, 1:5 Mob to dwell ratio, and other assumptions governing RC use. Key elements of their evaluation included OCO use, the limited flexibility of the 12304B authority, and RC duty Statuses.
- Admiral Cotton presented a working definition of the phrases Operational Reserve and Strategic Reserve. After some discussion, MG Lord, the Military Executive, set a suspense date of 13 January 2016 to submit edits and suggestions for the definitions to the Operational Reserve Subcommittee.
- The Subcommittee will provide recommendations for consideration at the March RFPB meeting.

1500 – Homeland Subcommittee Major General Tim Orr, USA, Subcommittee Chair

1505 – Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board – MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro asked members of the public to leave the room due to markings on slides indicating the material was not releasable to the public.

- BG Hilty, the Dual Status Commander for the World Meeting of Families and the Papal visit to Pennsylvania discussed the key elements of the operation and the role the Pennsylvania National Guard and US NORTHCOM had for the event. BG Hilty described the Dual Status Command structure as a continued success for the Title 10 / Title 32 Command and control for these types of events.
- He also mentioned the event was designated a National Special Security Event which activated Presidential Policy Directive 22, but the National Guard didn't get reimbursed for the event outside of base budget funding.

1530 – 1535 – Closing Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- Chairman Punaro thanked all in attendance for their support of the RFPB and the men and women of our Reserve Components.
- The Reserve Forces Policy Board concluded business, and the meeting was adjourned.

**\*\*End of Open Meeting\*\***



Arnold L. Punaro  
Major General, USMCR (Ret)  
Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board