



Office of the Secretary of Defense
Reserve Forces Policy Board
Quarterly Meeting Minutes



Wednesday, September 2, 2015

Location: Army Navy Country Club, Arlington, Virginia

Members Present

1. Major General Arnold Punaro, USMCR (Ret) Chairman
2. Lieutenant General David Barno, USA (Ret), Distinguished Practitioner in Residence, American University's School of International Service (SIS) Faculty
3. Sergeant Major Michael Biere, USAR Enlisted Military Advisor to the RFPB (Non-voting)
4. VADM John Cotton, USN (Ret)
5. Doctor Janine Davidson, Senior Fellow for Defense Policy at Council on Foreign Relations
6. Rear Admiral Brian LaRoche, USN
7. Major General Walter Lord, ARNG Military Executive of the Board (Non-voting)
8. The Honorable Grier Martin, Member North Carolina House of Representatives
9. Doctor John Nagl, Headmaster, The Haverford School
10. Mr. Sergio Pecori, President & Chief Executive Officer of Hanson Professional Services Inc.
11. Rear Admiral Francis Pelkowski, USCGR
12. Lieutenant General Jimmy Sherrard, USAFR (Ret)
13. Ms. MaryAnn Tierney, FEMA Region III
14. Major General Burke Whitman, USMCR

Invited Guests

1. Mr. Dennis Biddick, Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Navy, Manpower & Reserve Affairs & Total Force Integration
2. Lieutenant General Mark Brilakis, Deputy Commandant for Manpower & Reserve Affairs, USMC
3. Rear Admiral Robert Burke, Director, Military Personnel Plans & Policy, USN
4. The Honorable Brad Carson, Acting Under Secretary of Defense (Personnel & Readiness)
5. Lieutenant General Stanley Clarke III, Director, Air National Guard
6. The Honorable Anne Davis, Acting Assistant Secretary of the Navy, Manpower & Reserve Affairs
7. Brigadier General Ivan Denton, ARNG, Director, National Guard Bureau J-1
8. Rear Admiral Janet Donovan, USN, Chairman, Navy Reserve Forces Policy Board
9. Mr. Daniel Feehan, OUSD P&R, Principal Director Assistant Secretary of Defense Readiness
10. Mr. John Fedrigo, Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Air Force, Reserve Affairs & Airman Readiness
11. Colonel Michael Gerock, Director, Manpower Personnel & Services NGB A-1
12. Major General Gus Hargett, ARNG (Ret), President of the National Guard Association of the United States
13. Mr. John Hastings, DASD Resources, OASD M&RA
14. Rear Admiral Kurt Hinrichs, USCGR, Acting Director Reserve & Military Personnel, USCG
15. Major General Lewis Irwin, USAR
16. Lieutenant General Timothy Kadavy, Director, Army National Guard
17. Brigadier General Brian Kelly, Deputy Chief of Staff Manpower, Personnel & Services, USAF A-1
18. Major General Glenn Lesniak, Deputy Chief, Army Reserve
19. Rear Admiral Thomas Luscher, Deputy Chief, Navy Reserve
20. Lieutenant General James McConville, Deputy Chief of Staff, G-1, U. S. Army

21. Major General Maryanne Miller, Deputy Chief of Air Force Reserve
22. Colonel Ellen Moore, USAFR, Director Manpower, Personnel & Services AFRC
23. Lieutenant General Richard P. Mills, Commander, Marine Forces Reserve
24. Major General Timothy Orr, ARNG
25. The Honorable Terry O'Connell, RFPB Former Chairman
26. Mr. Raymond Rees, Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Army, Manpower & Reserve Affairs
27. Major General Scott Rice, ANG
28. Lieutenant General Robert Ruark, USMC, Military Deputy OUSD P&R
29. Mr. Guy Sandspingot, Office of the Chief, Army Reserve, Director of Human Capital
30. Mr. Daniel Sitterly, Principal Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Air Force, Manpower & Reserve Affairs
31. Lieutenant Colonel Julie Smalls, ANG, National Guard Reserve Matters VA Benefits
32. Mr. Robert Smiley, PDASD Readiness, Training, & Mobilization, OASD M&RA
33. Lt Gen Charles Stenner, USAFR (Ret)
34. Major General William Waldrop, Assistant to the CJCS for National Guard & Reserve Matters
35. Major General James Witham, Deputy Director, Air National Guard
36. Brigadier General James Wong, Special Assistant Army National Guard
37. The Honorable Albert Zapanta, RFPB Former Chairman
38. Joseph Adams, Institute for Defense Analyses
39. Amy Alrich, Institute for Defense Analyses
40. Lance Hancock, Institute for Defense Analyses
41. Peter Picucci, Institute for Defense Analyses
42. Richard Poulin, Institute for Defense Analyses
43. Jenns Robertson, Institute for Defense Analyses

RFPB Staff

1. Colonel Timothy Lynch, USAR, Chief of Staff
2. Mr. Alexander Sabol, DoD Civilian (Designated Federal Officer)
3. Col Mark Cancian, USMCR (Ret) RFPB Consultant
4. Colonel Ty Clifton, USAR
5. Captain Jay Gagne, USN
6. Colonel Jay Jensen, USAFR
7. Colonel Brad Martsching, ARNG
8. Colonel Bart Pester, USMCR
9. Sergeant First Class India Boddie, ARNG
10. Ms. Cindy Tyrie, Administrative Assistant

Public Observers

1. Major General Paul Bergson, USA (Ret)
2. Colonel Paul Briggs, USMCR (Ret)
3. Colonel Martin Carpenter USAFR (Ret)
4. Lieutenant Colonel John Paul Cook, USAR/Alumni
5. The Honorable Mark Davidson, Former DASN Manpower & Reserve Affairs
6. Major General Larry Taylor, USMC (Ret)
7. Colonel Robert Feidler (Ret), USAR/ Reserve Officer Association
8. Major General Jerry White, USAF (Ret)

9. Major General Richard Wightman, Jr., USAR (Ret)/Former Acting ASD RA
10. Lieutenant Commander Carinda Albright, USN, Deputy Navy JAG (Reserve Affairs & Operations) Aide
11. Lieutenant Colonel John Bates, ARNG, Office Assistant CJCS for National Guard & Reserve Matters
12. Colonel Tom Barton, USAR, Office of the Chief, Army Reserve
13. Lieutenant Colonel Mark Boettcher, ARNG, ARNG G-1
14. Mark Caruso, National Guard Association of the United States
15. Colonel Christine Capps, USAF, AFA Government Relations
16. Lieutenant Colonel Willie Cooper, USAF, AF/A11
17. Captain Randy Crysel, USN, Chief of Naval Operations OPNAV 95
18. Mr. Matt Dubois, DASD M&F/OASD M&RA
19. Colonel Susie Granger, Office of the Chief, Army Reserve, G-1
20. Colonel William Hersh, ARNG, ARNG Comptroller
21. Captain Thomas Jones, USN (Ret), Former RA and SAF MRA
22. Lieutenant Colonel Mark Jimison, ROA Dir Legislative and Mil Policy
23. Captain John Kreitz, USN, Exec Asst./ASN(M&RA)
24. Captain Cheryl Lauer, USN, N-1 Reserve Personnel Plans and Policy Branch
25. Major General Glenn Lesniak, ARNG, (Ret) National Guard Association of the United States
26. Mike Little, AF AETC AFHRA/SP
27. Susan Lukas
28. Dr. Forrest Marion, OUSD P-R Asst. Dir Man, Lg, Sys
29. Charles Martin, Office Chief Naval Reserve
30. Dr. Michael McMullan, National Guard Bureau J-5
31. Lieutenant Colonel Jon Middaugh , USA, Center of Military History
32. Commander Shawn Murphy, USN, AUSN
33. Maria Murphy, Office Assistant to the CJCS for National Guard & Reserve Matters
34. Colonel Robert Preiss, ARNG, ODASA Training, Readiness, & Mobilization
35. SMSgt Paul Rayman, Office of the Chief, Army Reserve
36. Lynn Schneider, DUSN (M)
37. Captain Miranda Summers-Lowe, USA, Center of Military History
38. Colonel Roger Suro, USA, OUSD P-R
39. Rear Admiral (L) Barb Sweredoski, OPNAV N13R/Reserve Deputy, Military Personnel Plans & Policy
40. Commander Jon Townsend, USN, ASN M&RA
41. Mike Waite, National Guard Association of the United States
42. Major Lisa Winegar, USA, Military Assistant/OUSD P&R

0800 – Chairman Punaro administratively opened the Board to conduct required administrative business.

- The Chairman welcomed members, staff, and public to the RFPB Annual Meeting.

0805 - Military Executive provided administrative announcements to the Board and other attendees.

0810 - Chairman Punaro administered the oath to Rear Admiral Pelkowski and Mr. Mark Cancian.

0815 - Chairman Punaro presided over an awards ceremony for departing Board members Mr. Grier Martin and Mr. Sergio Pecori.

0820 - Opening Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board – MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro.

- The Chairman called the meeting to order and announced, as required by the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), that the Designated Federal Officer was present and had pre-approved the opening of the meeting and the agenda.
- The Chairman announced the meeting was open to the public and noted no persons had submitted requests to appear before the Board. The Chairman asked if anyone present wished to address the Board and no one indicated a desire to do so.
- The Chairman noted that the Force of the Future initiative was the focus of the meeting and reviewing it was a direct tasking from the Secretary of Defense.

0825 – Brig Gen Brian T. Kelly, Director of Military Force Management Policy Deputy Chief of Staff for Manpower, Personnel and Services, U.S. Air Force presented a brief on the FotF impacts to the Air Force.

- Brig Gen Kelly noted that balancing manpower, modernization, and readiness is a challenge. Must look at what the Air Force can afford while remaining ready and preparing for the future.
- The Air Force had been downsizing but destabilization in Eastern Europe and the growth of ISIS now require an increase in manpower.
- The Air Force looks at the Total Force to meet requirements and seeks permeability; enabling personnel transitions between the AC and RC.
- The Air Force is testing Total Force Support Squadrons at 4 locations to service both active and reserve component personnel.
- Overall there is much overlap with FotF, but there are concerns with the timeline for implementation and unknown impacts.
- Chief of the Air Force Reserve noted that the Air Force and employers of Reserve Airmen preferred more frequent rotations of less duration. The Chairman noted that Goldwater-Nichols took a long time to implement and that FotF implementation would likely take 10 years.
- LTG Barno noted that changes to policy for Officers could result in each service having a completely different Officer Corps, with potential negative impacts to future Joint operations.

0910 – Break

0920 – RADM Robert Burke, Director, Military Personnel Plans and Policy, USN, presented a brief on Sailor of 2025 and FotF impacts.

- RADM Burke opened with the question - why was change needed? He suggested at least part of the answer is that recruiting will be harder and millennials like technology and engagement with the process.
- RADM Burke presented three tenets of the Sailor of 2025:
 - A Modernized Personnel System. Commanders will have more say on who gets promoted, boards will become “blind,” and the focus will be on talent and not just previous performance.
 - Ready, Relevant Learning. Training will be continuous with heavy use of technology.

- Enriched Culture. Teamwork and unit performance remain enduring values while the Force will become more empowered, diverse, and resilient, with a focus on families. Women will constitute up to 25% of accessions by 2025. Maternity leave will be increased and all ships will be open for females.

1005 – Break

1015 – The Honorable Brad R. Carson, Acting Under Secretary of Defense (Personnel and Readiness) spoke on the Force of the Future initiative. Mr. Carson stated that the DoD's personnel systems were once considered a model of industry, but that is no longer true and the systems must be updated.

- In order to retain talent, FotF will update DoD's personnel system by knowing people, providing customized career paths, and maximizing talent.
- Rigid career paths dictated by DOPMA and the 'up or out' policy need to be replaced with a 'perform or out' system. Officers typically retire after 22 years, often when they are at the peak of their performance. Any deviation from the current career path can result in non-selection and the loss of talent, creating enormous retraining costs.
- Diversity benefits the Force and remains a priority, along with increased education.
- DoD needs to learn from the best practices of industry and implement change or risk losing our most talented performers.
- Dr. Nagl asked a question on timelines and Mr. Carson answered that he hoped to have this done as soon as possible, refusing to believe that the Department is incapable of making changes in a matter of months if it chooses to do so.
- VADM Cotton noted that DoDI 1235.12, *Accessing the Reserve Components (RC)* is in staffing and compiles lessons learned from mobilizing the RC into one document. He noted that the instruction is important and requested consideration in expediting its approval.

1045 – 1050 Break

1050 – Major General Arnold L. Punaro, USMCR (Ret), Chairman of the RFPB presented Board administrative business.

- The report format for the RFPB Annual Report was officially adopted.
- Subcommittee membership and the proposed schedule for next year were presented.

1110 – Lieutenant General James C. McConville, Deputy Chief of Staff, G-1, U.S. Army provided a brief on Army manpower and potential FotF reform impacts.

- LTG McConville commented on the Army's drawdown and noted that when determining the final size of the Army, the Total Force must be considered with the RC filling both strategic and operational roles.
- He noted that although the Total Force has come down, FTS has grown slightly, but declining from where it was and that it is important to generating reserve component readiness.
- He noted a focus on building a quality force of committed soldiers consisting of empowered, diverse, cohesive teams that will solve many issues at the lowest level. Attrition for first term soldiers is too high, requiring more resiliency. Only 10% of enlisted soldiers and 30% of Officers remain for 20 years.

- The Army needs to send top performers to schools, and enlisted PME will now be required. Officers will be allowed to select only one soldier as the top performer when completing NCOERs.
- One personnel system is being developed for the Army's three components.
- The Army must manage talent with a new personnel system which will help identify talent so the right soldiers are retained and promoted.

1210 – Break/Lunch Service

1240 – Lieutenant General Mark A. Brilakis, Deputy Commandant for Manpower and Reserve Affairs, U.S. Marine Corps, provided a briefing on manpower and FotF impacts. Chairman Punaro also recognized Lieutenant General Richard Mills, Commander Marine Forces Reserve, for his support to the RFPB on his pending Change of Command and retirement.

- LtGen Brilakis observed that finding and retaining talent remains difficult but the quality of current officer and enlisted accessions remains high, with Recruit Training attrition at just under 7% and TBS under 2%. OCS and Boot Camp are part of the screening process.
- Readiness remains a priority. Female percentage of overall manpower may rise to 10%; latitude exists for this change as long as readiness remains high.
- The Marine Corps is a young force and the right leader at the lowest level can often solve problems such as suicide and sexual assault.
- To achieve the Commandant's Planning Guidance, M&RA is determining where everyone is assigned, developing a plan to ensure "Squad Leader" billets are manned, and reviewing TTPs of the Human Resources Development Plan.
- USMC supports the intent of FotF but has concerns over development and implementation. Many authorities currently exist and the Marine Corps is already executing some actions similar to the FotF. Must know more about impacts and the replacement for DOPMA. The fear is that the final FotF report will be prescriptive and not include input from services.
- USMC will use 12304b authority for the first time in FY17 to send an infantry battalion to Okinawa.
- DoD previously funded an overall recruiting campaign but doesn't anymore, leaving it up to each service.

1335 – Break

1335 – Rear Admiral Kurt B. Hinrichs, Acting Director, Reserve & Military Personnel, U. S. Coast Guard, reviewed 13 FotF reform proposals and impact to the Coast Guard. Rear Admiral Hinrichs was recognized with a certificate by Chairman Punaro for his participation on the RFPB.

- RADM Hinrichs observed that the Coast Guard is experiencing record retention and requires more flexibility for career advancement.
- The Coast Guard has no mechanism for O6/E7 lateral entry although there currently is no need. He suggested cyber requirements may change this.
- The Coast Guard has already implemented "blind" promotion boards.
- A program currently exists to recruit at historically Black, Hispanic, and Native American Colleges paying Officer Candidates as an E3 while also providing scholarships.
- The Coast Guard has one, fully integrated HR system for AC and RC.

1420 – Break

1430 – Vice Admiral John Cotton (Ret), Chair of the Operational Reserve Subcommittee, introduced Mr. Joe Adams from the Institute for Defense Analyses (IDA) to provide an update on a study of RC performance during Operation Iraqi Freedom.

- Mr. Adams provided background on how the study was being conducted. He reviewed personnel contributions by service, SIGACTS, THOR Aviation Database input, mission and performance assessments, lessons learned, transcripts, and interviews, and briefly commented on forthcoming engagements and obstacles and challenges related to the study.
- It was noted that only 2 of 40 BCTs were suggested to have performed poorly, meaning 95% met requirements or performed well.
- VADM Cotton provided a brief update on the Operational Reserve Subcommittee to include Key Leader Engagements and methods for accessing the RC.
- VADM Cotton recommended that the RFPB support efforts to streamline access to the RC through a revision of DoDI 1235.12 and that the Board reintroduce a standard DoD definition for “Operational Reserve.”

1545- Rear Admiral Brian LaRoche provided an update from the Personnel Subcommittee and brought a recommendation to the Board for consideration.

- The Personnel Subcommittee recently took an in-depth look at the Services’ IRR programs to gain an understanding of longstanding issues in managing the IRR. The subcommittee found the IRR remains difficult to manage, access is a cumbersome and lengthy process, and there is no central strategy to manage the IRR.
- The subcommittee recommended that the Department establish a Joint Working Group to seek quick wins and explore alternative management structures and methods to improve efficiency and more effectively utilize the IRR in support of the Total Force. The recommendation was seconded and approved by the Board.

1605 – Closing Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- Chairman Punaro thanked all in attendance for their support of the RFPB and the men and women of our Reserve Components.
- The Reserve Forces Policy Board concluded business and the meeting was adjourned.



Arnold L. Punaro
Major General, USMCR (Ret)
Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board

