



Office of the Secretary of Defense
Reserve Forces Policy Board
Quarterly Meeting Minutes



Wednesday, March 8, 2017
Location of Meeting: Pentagon Room 3E863

Members Present

1. Major General Arnold Punaro, USMCR (Ret) – Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board
2. Sergeant Major Michael Lewis ARNG - Enlisted Military Advisor to the RFPB (Non-voting)
3. Lieutenant General David Barno, USA (Ret), Distinguished Practitioner in Residence, American University's School of International Service (SIS) Faculty
4. Dr. Nora Bensahel, Distinguished Practitioner in Residence, American University's School of International Service (SIS) Faculty
5. Major General Daryl Bohac, ANG, Adjutant General, Nebraska National Guard
6. Mr. Phillip Carter, Senior Fellow, Center for a New American Security (CNAS)
7. Vice Admiral John Cotton, USN (Ret), Defense and Security Consultant
8. Major General Lewis Irwin, Commanding General, 416th Theater Engineer Command, Army Reserve
9. Mr. Brett Lambert, Vice President for Corporate Strategy, Northrop Grumman Corp
10. Major General Walter Lord, Military Executive (Non-Voting), Reserve Forces Policy Board
11. Rear Admiral Francis Pelkowski, USCGR, Deputy Commandant of Coast Guard Operations
12. Major General Timothy Orr, ARNG, Adjutant General, Iowa National Guard
13. Lieutenant General Charles Stenner, USAFR (Ret)
14. Ms. MaryAnn Tierney, Regional Administrator, FEMA Region III
15. Doctor Charlotte Warren, President, Lincoln Land Community College
16. Major General Burke Whitman, USMCR,
17. Major General Cornell Wilson, Jr, USMCR (Ret)
18. Major General Sheila Zuehlke, USAFR, Mobilization Assistant (MA) to the Commander, 24th Air Force

Invited Guests

1. Mr. Dennis Biddick, DASN M&RA/Total Force Integration
2. Mr. James Brooks, Executive Director Air National Guard
3. Mr. Brad Byers, Senior White House Advisor, Department of Defense
4. Major General Phillip Churn, ARNG, Assistant. to the CJCS, for Reserve Matters
5. Mr. Matt Dubois, DASD RI (Reserve Integration)
6. Major General Walter Fountain, USAR, Assistant CJCS VDJ8 National Guard Matters
7. Mr. John Hastings, DASD Readiness Program & Resources/OASD Readiness
8. Lieutenant General Daniel Hokanson, ARNG, Vice Chief of the National Guard Bureau
9. Mr. Anthony Kurta, Performing the Duties of the Under Secretary of Defense for Personnel and Readiness
10. Lieutenant General Charles D. Luckey, USAR, Chief Army Reserve
11. Colonel Tim Lynch, USAR, Army Reserve Forces Policy Board
12. Vice Admiral Luke McCollum, USN, Chief of Navy Reserve
13. Lieutenant General Rex McMillian, USMCR, Commander, Marine Forces Reserve
14. Mr. Raymond Rees, Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Army, Manpower & Reserve Affairs
15. Lieutenant Colonel Julie Small, ANG (Ret), Senior Program Analyst, VA Office of Policy and Planning
16. Brigadier General Paul Guemmer, USAF, Air Force Total Force Continuum Office
17. Brigadier General Greg Haase, ANG, Air Force Total Force Continuum Office
18. Lieutenant Colonel Sarah Emory, USAF, Air Force Total Force Continuum Office
19. Major General Steve Grove, USA, National Commission on the Future of the Army Tri-Chair Office

20. Lieutenant General Timothy Kadavy, ARNG, Director, Army National Guard
21. Major General Mike Navrkal, ARNG, National Commission on the Future of the Army Tri-Chair Office
22. Major General Michael Smith, USAR, Deputy Chief of the Army Reserve, National Commission on the Future of the Army Tri-Chair Office
23. Mr. Jim Boatner, Office of the U.S. Army Deputy Chief of Staff, G-8 (Quadrennial Defense Review)
24. Mr. Jenns Robertson, Institute for Defense Analysis
25. Mr. Richard Polin, Institute for Defense Analysis

RFPB Staff

1. Colonel Bart Pester, USMCR, Chief of Staff
2. Captain Jay Gagne, USN
3. Mr. Alexander Sabol, DoD Civilian (Designated Federal Officer)
4. Colonel Eric Folkestad, USAR
5. Colonel Matt Groves, ANG
6. Colonel Bill Hersh, ARNG
7. Colonel Kevin Merrill, USAFR
8. Sergeant First Class Jay Brown, ARNG
9. Sergeant First Class Yolanda Gomez, USAR
10. Ms. Cindy Tyrie, Administrative Assistant

RFPB Consultants

1. Colonel Mark Cancian, USMCR (Ret)
2. Major Jason Hollan, USAR
3. Lieutenant Lena Moore, USN
4. Captain Austin Murnane, USMCR

The RFPB Fellows Society/Alumni

1. COL Robert Green, USA (Ret), Vice President of the RFPB Fellows Society
2. Major General Larry Taylor, USMC (Ret)

Other Guests

1. Colonel David Anderson, USAFR, Director Reserve Integration/OASD/M&RA
2. Brigadier General Jeffery Cashman, ANG, Special Assist, ANG Total Force Continuum (HAF/A8XF)
3. Ms. Gina Kraper, Total Force Continuum Office (HAF/A8XF)
4. Lieutenant Commander Brandon Decker, USN, Aide, Chief of Navy Reserve
5. Force Command Master Chief Clarence Mitchell, USN, SEA FORCOM Navy Reserve
6. Mr. Josh Myerson, Strategic Policy Analyst, NG-J52, Contractor (ITA International)
7. Colonel Francis Piccoli, USMCR, Headquarters, Marine Forces Reserve
8. Ms. Aniela Szymanski, Military Officer Association
9. Mr. Ben Booker, Reserve Officers Association
10. Ms. Susan Lucas, Director Legislation & Military Policy, Reserve Officers Association
11. CAPT (Ret) Brett Korade, Director, Naval Services Section, Reserve Officers Association
12. First Lieutenant John McElligott, USAR, Deputy Executive Director, Commissioned Officers Association of the U.S. Public Health Service, Inc.
13. Sergeant Alicia Brand, USA, Army Photographer
14. Specialist Tammy Nooner, USA, Army Photographer
15. Mr. Douglas Lovely, USA, Army Audio Visual Team
16. Sergeant Sherrod Percell, USA, Army Audio Visual Team
17. Specialist Patrick VanBuren, USA, Army Audio Visual Team
18. Lieutenant Commander John McElliot, USN

19. Lieutenant Colonel Staley Wiechnik, USAR

The Reserve Forces Policy Board (RFPB) held a quarterly meeting in the Pentagon, Washington, DC on March 8, 2017 in Room 3E863.

0800 – Chairman Punaro administratively opened the Board to conduct required administrative business and welcomed members, staff, and invited guests.

0805 – Military Executive provided additional administrative announcements to the Board.

0810 – Chairman Punaro presided over an awards ceremony for departing Staff members Captain Jay Gagne, USN and Sergeant First Class Jay Brown, ARNG.

****Start of Closed Meeting****

0815 – Closed Session Opening Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- The Chairman announced this portion of the meeting was closed to the public from 8:15 a.m. to 11:45 a.m.
- The meeting was closed in accordance with provisions outlined by the Government in the Sunshine Act, as amended by 5 U.S.C. § 552b(c)(1) and the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), as amended by 5 U.S.C. Appendix (Executive Order 13526 – Classified National Security Information).
- The Chairman called the meeting to order and announced, as required by the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), that the Designated Federal Officer was present and had pre-approved the opening of the meeting and the agenda.

**0820 – Major General Sheila Zuehlke, USAFR
- Homeland Security Subcommittee Board Member**

- During the closed session, Maj Gen Zuehlke provided an update on the Department of Defense Cyber Approach and Use of the National Guard and Reserve in the Cyber Mission Force and analyzed progress in achieving RFPB recommendations regarding integration of Guard and Reserve Forces to the mission. The details of Maj Gen Zuehlke's remarks will remain restricted from this document due to national security concerns.

0920 – Break

**0930 – Brig Gen Greg Haase, Brig Gen Paul Guemmer,
- Air Force Total Force Continuum Office**

- Brig Gen Guemmer provided updates on the implementation of recommendations from the National Commission on the Structure of the Air Force report of January 2014.
- The Air Force addressed the NCSAF findings by assembling a Total Force Continuum (TF-C) to strengthen the Air Force through the better integration of the active and reserve components.
- Their current analysis initiatives include: Fighter pilot shortfall; Reserve pilot integration; Initial Skills Training Modeling; Integrated Wing (I-Wing); Public Affairs Combat Camera Association.
- Lessons learned from previous initiatives: Rebalance the components vs simply growing them; Identify TF mission areas have the best "return on investment; Many legislative changes require joint support.

1015 – LTG Timothy Kadavy, MG Michael Smith, MG Steve Grove, MG Mike Navrkal

- National Commission for the Future of the Army (NCFA) Tri-Chair Committee

- MG Grove introduced himself as the regular Army general officer member of the Army Tri-Chair committee which also consists of one general officer each from the Army National Guard and Army Reserve. He oversees the Army Quadrennial Defense Review Office which is charged with assessing and implementing the 63 recommendations from the NCFA report. He conveyed to the board that the Army has made significant progress moving to a Total Army composed of trained, integrated, and ready soldiers and leaders from all three components capable of dominating on any battlefield.
- MG Smith, the Army Reserve Tri-Chair member is the longest serving member and related that GEN Milley, from the beginning, has challenged the committee and the Army Enterprise to deliver the best possible analysis and results and MG Smith believes they have succeeded. He further highlighted the unique roles of each of the Army components and supported MG Groves comments that it takes all members of the Army team to achieve.
- MG Navrkal, is the Army National Guard Tri-Chair member who commented that the Army National Guard is heavily involved in several multi-year pilot programs directed by the NCFA and that state governors and the Congress were pleased with the degree of the National Guard's inclusion in the entire process.
- LTG Kadavy, the Director of the Army National Guard began his comments by saying "there is absolutely zero daylight between himself and GEN Milley when it comes to delivering the best and ready Army National Guard units to accomplish the National Security goals of the United States." He added that never before has the Guard been as focused in achieving readiness goals as they prepare for even more CTC rotations for Guard units to support the Army mission.

1100 – Break

1115 – Mr. Jenns Robertson & Mr. Richard Polin, - Institute for Defense Analysis

- Mr. Robertson and Mr. Polin provided an update on their findings in Phase II of their operational effectiveness study on the Reserve Components during Operation Enduring Freedom.
- They presented two briefings. Mr. Polin provided a comparison between the wars in Iraq and Afghanistan trends in ground violence and a more detailed breakout by Service and component SIGACTs, activity levels, mission profiles, and measures of interest for IED's and direct fire attacks.
- In the second presentation, Mr. Robertson presented the kinetic activities from the ground SIGACTS database and the air MISREP database, synchronized the databases in time and space, and then counted up activity over each one square kilometer of ground and airspace to identify if there were identifiable boundaries and distinct battlefields.
- Mr. Robertson discussed specific battlefields with this methodology, and has begun to look at how they evolve over space and time, and can start to say a few things about how to characterize what the Joint fight looks like at the tip of the tactical spear.
- Mr. Robertson concluded with a summary of remaining tasks, an estimated time of completion, and a brief overview of the next part of the study covering Operation Enduring Freedom.

****End of Closed Meeting****

1145 – Break

****Start of Open Meeting****

1225 – Opening Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board – MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro.

- The Chairman called the meeting to order and announced, as required by the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), that the Designated Federal Officer was present and had pre-approved the opening of the meeting and the agenda.
- The Chairman announced the meeting was open to the public and noted no persons had submitted requests to appear before the Board. The Chairman asked if anyone present wished to address the Board and no one indicated a desire to do so.

1230 – Reserve Component Chiefs Briefings:

1230 – Vice Admiral Luke McCollum, USN

- Chief of the Navy Reserve

- VADM McCollum briefed that he was new in the position and that his focus is on understanding the operating environment at the lowest levels of the Navy Reserve. He stated that if you ask the E-5 that hasn't been in their position very long if they have everything they need they will say "Yes, sir. I do" but the E-5 standing next to him that has been there longer will beg to differ and that's the opinion he is after.
- He is also looking to grow the leadership skillsets which allow leaders to be very comfortable with states of ambiguity because that's the kind of environment we find ourselves in. At the strategic level, this means the budget we don't yet have.
- Making sure we have the right policy in place is also a driver that he is concerned about so we make sure we can recruit and retain the best sailors possible. One example was when he was in a high demand civilian occupation that required global travel, and more than once, the Navy asked him to show up on the other side of the globe. This always required him to travel to his home of record in Arkansas first, in order to comply with travel regulations. This kind of thing is what needs to be fixed if we are to keep as many of the good people as we can.
- VADM McCollum then stated that he has spoken about some of his tactical concerns but now would like to highlight the progress we have made at the strategic level. One of those is to make sure the Navy Reserve is integrated in the Total Force of 2025 and the capability requirements reflect that Navy Reserve "use statements" are inserted in the language.
- Admiral (Ret) Cotton asked VADM McCollum what will be the impact of a statutory reduction from O-9 to O-8 mean to the next Chief in accomplishing their duties? VADM McCollum: "It will depend on the person in the position but that individual will inherently be more effective wearing three stars just based on the fact that such an officer will have the benefit of more experience and will be an equal at the table with other three stars."

1310 – Lieutenant General Charles Luckey, USAR

- Chief of the Army Reserve

- LTG Luckey stated his tenure as NORTHCOM Chief of Staff provided him with unique exposure to homeland security issues and prepared him well to become the Chief of the Army Reserve.
- His priority as the Chief is to focus on what GEN Milley describes as those "Red Pen" threats to the nation and to make sure he is providing the kind of trained and ready forces required to answer and defeat them. Many of these capabilities are found predominately or exclusively within the Army Reserve – the challenge is identifying the requirement and timing the need.
- LTG Luckey illustrated the previous point by highlighting the 316th Expeditionary Sustainment Command from Coraopolis, PA presently deployed in Kuwait and Iraq. The unit is deployed with a high percentage

of cross leveled personnel from other units revealing that not all units are in the right geographic location for effective recruiting and retention. This is a concern he is focusing on in his tenure.

- Other issues include a higher than desired number of non-deployable personnel in the Active Guard Reserve (AGR) force. “We have to drive these numbers down so they are the lowest percentage in the force – I’ve directed the senior 2 star general in each chain of command to personally brief me on the status of every one of them. So we’re getting after it”
- “Last and also first in my priorities is generating readiness within those units we have identified in our ‘Ready Force.’ ” These are those units specifically identified by the Army during the Sustainable Readiness Process to meet the 0-90 day go to war requirements.”

1400 – Lieutenant General Rex McMillian, USMCR - Commander Marine Forces Reserve

- LtGen McMillian stated that he has good leadership and morale within Marine Forces Reserve. His main concern is the next fight, particularly with a near-peer competitor. In response, his top three priorities as Commander are readiness, readiness, and readiness.
- LtGen McMillian's key questions revolve around readiness:
 1. What have we done to increase readiness?
 2. Are our units ready?
- From his perspective, the answers lie in training which is the key. LtGen McMillian wants Commanders to focus on putting rounds downrange, and not become consumed with meeting all annual training requirements at the expense of real training. In the end that is also what Congress wants from Marines. The RC may not have time to prepare for a conflict in the future, and must be able to fight tonight. Units must be able to shoot, move, and communicate on short to no notice.
- LtGen McMillian asked the RFPB for help in the following areas:
 1. Not losing good officers to Joint billets. Officers need to be able to get credit for assignments that may not be on the JDAL but still provide joint experience.
 2. Gain the ability to move units. LtGen McMillian currently has F-18s in Fort Worth, TX and C-130s in Newburgh, NY with no ground units to support or train with.
 3. NGREA - MARFORRES can use additional funds.
 4. Update the JFTR to support reservists. As written, the focus is on the active component and the JFTR does not support reservists well.

1440 – Subcommittee Updates

1440 – Lt Gen Charles Stenner, USAFRN (Ret), Subcommittee Chair Personnel Subcommittee - Subcommittee on Supporting and Sustaining Reserve Component Personnel

- Lt Gen Stenner discussed Duty Status Reform (DSR), General/Flag Officer (GO/FO) changes in the 2017 NDAA, and reservist contribution limits to the Blended Retirement System:
- DSR initiative as briefed by ODASD(MPP) is good in concept:
 1. “The devil is in the details!”
 2. The specifics will not be known until legislation is drafted.
 3. 400+ legislative changes required.
- The Subcommittee finds that until proposed legislative changes are known not enough information is available at this time to offer a recommendation of support for DSR.
- GO/FO: RFPB Personnel Sub-committee Recommendation: Monitor each Service and Component for indication of rank reduction. If it appears a service intends to reduce rank to O-8, offer RFPB

recommendation to *reinstate the statutory requirement of O-9 for the Vice Chief of the National Guard Bureau, the Directors of the Army and Air National Guard, and the Chiefs of each Reserve Component.*

- Blended Retirement: The Personnel SC will continue to monitor H.R. 1317 and S.492. Consider recommending that OSD support the new bills, proposing changes in tax law which state:
 1. Selected Reserve Component personnel may apply the limit for retirement contributions separately to civilian and military accounts.
 2. H.R. 1317 was submitted in the 115th Congress.
 3. S.492 introduced March 3rd by Senator Cornyn (Texas) and Senator Casey (Pennsylvania).

**1510 – Operational Reserve Subcommittee VADM John Cotton, USN (Ret), Subcommittee Chair
- Subcommittee on Ensuring a Ready, Capable, Available, and Sustainable Operational Reserve**

- VADM Cotton provided an update of a previous RFPB recommendation regarding the creation of an official definition for the Operational Reserve. Essentially, that recommendation stalled in OSD staffing and was not acted on under the previous SECDEF.
- The second topic VADM Cotton addressed was deployment authorities that expire if the current Declaration of National Emergency isn't extended. This situation will leave 12304b as the only mobilization authority available which has a ceiling of 60,000 reservists and lacks equal benefits of 12302 authorities.

1540 – Closing Remarks, by Military Executive, Reserve Forces Policy Board - Major General Walter Lord, ARNG

1545 – Closing Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board - MajGen (Ret) Arnold Punaro

- Chairman Punaro thanked all in attendance for their support of the RFPB and the men and women of the Reserve Components.
- The Reserve Forces Policy Board concluded business, and the meeting was adjourned.

****End of Open Meeting****



Arnold L. Punaro
Major General, USMCR (Ret)
Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board