



**Office of the Secretary of Defense**  
**Reserve Forces Policy Board**  
*Quarterly Meeting Minutes*  
**Wednesday, December 13, 2017**  
**Location of Meeting: Pentagon Room 3E863**



**Members Present**

1. Major General Arnold Punaro, USMCR (Ret), Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board
2. Sergeant Major Michael Lewis, ARNG, Enlisted Military Advisor to the RFPB (Non-voting)
3. Lieutenant General David Barno, USA (Ret), Distinguished Practitioner in Residence, American University's School of International Service (SIS) Faculty
4. Dr. Nora Bensahel, Distinguished Practitioner in Residence, American University's School of International Service (SIS) Faculty
5. Major General Daryl Bohac, ANG, The Adjutant General, Nebraska National Guard
6. Mr. Brett Lambert, Vice President for Corporate Strategy, Northrop Grumman Corp
7. Major General Walter Lord, Military Executive (Non-Voting), Reserve Forces Policy Board
8. Major General Timothy Orr, ARNG, The Adjutant General, Iowa National Guard
9. Rear Admiral Linda Wackerman, USN
10. Doctor Charlotte Warren, President, Lincoln Land Community College
11. Major General Burke Whitman, USMCR
12. Major General Sheila Zuehlke, USAFR, (Ret)

**Invited Guests**

1. Rear Admiral Russel Allen, USN, Chairman, Navy Reserve Forces Policy Board
2. Ms. Stephanie Barna, Acting ASD M&RA
3. SgtMaj Scott Barnett, USMCR, Marine Corps Reserve Policy Board
4. Mr. Travis W. Bartholomew, Strategic Communication & Public Affairs Director, FEPP ESGR
5. CMSgt Amanda Bertrand, USAF, Senior Enlisted Leader, ESGR
6. Mr. William Booth, Director Defense Human Resources Activity
7. Major General Kevin W. Bradley, USAF, USCYBERCOM
8. Mr. James Brooks, Executive Director, Air National Guard
9. Colonel Mark Burglund, USA, Military Executive Assistant to the Secretary of the Army (Manpower and Reserve Affairs)
10. MG Phillip Churn, USAR, Assistant to the Chairman, ACJCS VDJ4/RC Matters
11. Ms. Veronica Daigle, Principal Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense for Readiness
12. Tony Demo, Deputy Secretary of Defense Special Assistant
13. Rear Admiral David Dermanelian, USCG, J7 Director, Exercises and Training, USCYBERCOM
14. Mr. Matt Dubois, DASD Reserve Integration, OASD M&RA
15. Rachel Gleischman, Deputy Secretary of Defense Special Assistant
16. BG Patrick Hamilton, ARNG Director, Joint Staff, Joint Force Headquarters, Texas National Guard
17. Lieutenant General Daniel Hokanson, ARNG, Vice Chief, National Guard Bureau
18. Major General Laurel J. Hummel, ARNG, The Adjutant General, Alaska
19. Lieutenant Colonel Michael Jackson, USA, Under Secretary of the Army Military Assistant
20. Mr. Judd Lyons, Employer Support of the Guard and Reserve (ESGR)
21. Ms. Nicole Magney, Deputy Secretary of Defense Speech writer
22. General Craig McKinley, ANG (Ret), National Chairman, Employer Support of the Guard and Reserve (ESGR)
23. Maj Gen John Nichols, ANG, The Adjutant General, Texas
24. Captain Juliet Perkins, USN, Executive Director, Employer Support of the Guard and Reserve (ESGR)

25. Mr. Raymond Rees, Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Army, Manpower & Reserve Affairs
26. General Lori J. Robinson, USAF, Commander, NORAD and USNORTHCOM
27. Major General A.C. Roper, USAR
28. Maj Gen Derek Rydholm, USAFR, Deputy Chief, Air Force Reserve
29. Colonel Matthew Shaeffer, NORAD and USNORTHCOM
30. The Honorable Patrick M. Shanahan, Deputy Secretary of Defense
31. Mr. Scott Sharp, National Guard Bureau J8
32. Mr. Scott F. Thompson, Senior Attorney, Standards of Conduct Office, DoD Office of the General Counsel
33. The Honorable Robert L Wilkie, Under Secretary of Defense for Personnel and Readiness

#### **RFPB Staff**

1. Colonel Bart Pester, USMCR, Chief of Staff
2. Mr. Alexander Sabol, DoD Civilian (Designated Federal Officer)
3. Captain Matt Berta, USN
4. Colonel Eric Folkestad, USAR
5. Colonel Matt Groves, ANG
6. Colonel Bill Hersh, ARNG
7. Colonel Kevin Merrill, USAFR
8. Lt James McKnight, USCGR
9. Sergeant First Class Yolanda Gomez, USAR
10. Ms. Sonya Strader-Cherry, Administrative Assistant

#### **RFPB Consultants**

1. Major Austin Murnane, USMCR

#### **The RFPB Fellows Society/Alumni**

1. Captain Tom L. Jones, USN (Ret)
2. Major General Larry Taylor, USMCR (Ret)
3. The Honorable Albert Zapanta, Former Reserve Forces Policy Board Chairman

#### **Other Guests**

1. Mr. Scott Bousum, Legislative Director, Enlisted Association of the National Guard of the U.S.
2. Colonel Damon Cluch, ARNG, J3, Arkansas National Guard
3. Colonel Jason Knudsen, USAF, Executive Director Air Reserve Forces Policy Committee, SAF/MR
4. Captain John McCracken, USN, ASST SECNAV M&RA, Staff Director
5. Mr. Josh Myerson, Strategic Policy Analyst, NGB-J52, Contractor (ITA International)
6. Colonel Gregory Panker, ARNG, J5, Louisiana National Guard
7. Maj Renee Rausch, ANG, Iowa National Guard
8. Lieutenant Colonel Julie Small, USAF (Ret), National Guard & Reserve Matters Veterans Affairs Benefits/Alumni

#### **Army Audio Visual Team & Photographer**

1. Specialist George Denno, USA, Army Audio Visual Team
2. Staff Sergeant Kalie Frantz, USA, Army Photographer
3. Mr. Michael Caya, USA, Army Audio Visual Team
4. Mr. Leroy Council, Army Audio Visual Team
5. Specialist Tamy Noner, USA, Army Photographer



**The Reserve Forces Policy Board (RFPB) held a quarterly meeting in the Pentagon, Washington, DC on December 13, 2017 in room 3E863.**

**0800– RFPB Administrative Business Opening Remarks**

**-Major General Arnold L. Punaro, USMCR (Ret), *Chairman, RFPB***

- Chairman Punaro administratively opened the Board to conduct required administrative business. He welcomed members, new members, and nominated members, staff, and invited guests.

**0805 – Opening Remarks by Military Executive, Reserve Forces Policy Board**

**-Major General Walter Lord, ARNG**

- MG Lord provided additional administrative announcements to the Board and noted the meeting was being recorded.
- **Introduction of the Honorable Robert L. Wilkie, Under Secretary of Defense for Personnel and Readiness**

**\*\*Start of Closed Meeting\*\***

**\*\*Closed Meeting due to Classified Content\*\***

**0810 – Chairman’s Welcome and Opening Remarks**

**-Major General Arnold L. Punaro, USMCR (Ret), *Chairman, RFPB***

**-Mr. Alex Sabol, Designated Federal Officer’s Remarks**

- The Chairman called the meeting to order and announced, as required by the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), that the Designated Federal Officer was present and had pre-approved the opening of the meeting and the agenda.
- The Chairman announced the meeting was closed to the public and noted no persons had submitted requests to appear before the Board. The Chairman asked if anyone present wished to address the Board and no one indicated a desire to do so.

**0815 – The Honorable Ryan D. McCarthy, Under Secretary of the U.S. Army (USA)**

- USA McCarthy opened his talk with a quote from Abraham Lincoln telling General Ulysses Grant he must “Focus on the mission, I’ll take care of the politics” which is also his message to the force in the modern age. He further outlined an Army vision to fuse roles and responsibilities of multiple headquarters and agencies to increase efficiency and expand processes without creating new structure to do it.
- USA McCarthy discussed the need for modernizing weapons systems by highlighting the age of the “Big 5” hardware systems that supported Air Land Battle doctrine (UH-60, Bradley, M-1 Abrams, Patriot Missile system, and Apache AH-64). He stated that Future Combat Systems and Future Vertical Lift require full funding to maintain Army lethality and peer to peer overmatch.

- He stated that DoD Army political appointed positions in the Pentagon are less than half filled, and this is a challenge for effectively managing and resourcing the Army. He also said that requirements are increasing around the world at a pace far exceeding capacity, and that he will stop asking for more money when they stop asking for the Army.
- USA McCarthy stated that they are standing up more Security Force Assistance Brigades – 5 in the AC and 1 in the Army National Guard. He highlighted that we must maintain enough force structure in Europe to be a credible deterrent while reducing our Middle Eastern presence.
- Dr. Bensahel asked how will the Army mobilize in future conflict to levels not seen in generations? USA McCarthy stated that they are working on mobilization plans and increasing the number of mobilization platforms (installations) from 2 to about a dozen.

#### **0900 – General Lori Robinson, USAF, Commander, US Northern Command**

- Gen Lori Robinson briefed the RFPB on the North American Aerospace Defense Command (NORAD) and United States NORTHERN COMMAND, or NORTHCOM. She summarized the two commands and explained the differences of the two commands, their missions and organization, and the challenges they face today.
- She stated that NORAD and NORTHCOM are two unique commands in their structures, in their assigned missions, and in the authorities governing both commands.
- As Commander of both organizations, General Robinson stated that she wears multiple hats and has multiple reporting chains. She said that with the different hats mean different roles and missions with different authorities. She noted impact of the bi-national agreement throughout the command, with the NORAD agreement stipulating that the NORAD Deputy will always be a Canadian officer with the NORAD Commander from the U.S.
- She then said that she would describe NORAD and NORTHCOM separately, then bring discussion of the commands back together.
- She then explained that the command has a long history of defense cooperation between Canada & the United States, going back to the Ogdensburg Declaration (1940) between Prime Minister King & President Roosevelt.
- As for NORAD, Gen Robinson mentioned that it was born of the Cold War, but shaped by 9/11. She said that Article 1 of the 2006 NORAD Agreement, which is the latest one signed by both governments, assigns three missions to NORAD: Aerospace Warning, Aerospace Control, and Maritime Warning, however; these missions are not mutually exclusive in their execution and most of the time one mission will drive the other on the time continuum.
- She stated that NORAD is a bi-national command with the U.S. and Canada established in 1958, and that the NORAD Agreement is a formal military partnership, based upon a binding international agreement.



- As the Commander of NORAD Gen Robinson has 2 bosses. She said that she not only reports to the U.S. President through the Secretary of Defense, but that she also reports to the Prime Minister of Canada through the Canadian Chief of Defence Staff (CDS) and the Minister of National Defence. Gen Robinson said that she even had to interview with the CDS before her nomination could move forward to the Senate.
- Gen Robinson stated that NORAD has 3 regions, with 2 regions geographically located in the U.S.A. and led by American 3-star Generals with Canadian Deputy Commanders and the 1 region located in Canada and led by a Canadian 2-star General, with an American as the Deputy Commander. Relationships across all 3 regions are important. She said that they have good communication between the regions and with the strength of the bi-national command agreement, the regions work well together.
- Gen Robinson briefed that USNORTHCOM is a U.S. geographic combatant command established in 2002 because of 9/11.
- She briefed that their Area of Responsibility (AOR) includes all air, land and sea approaches to North America, encompassing the continental U.S., Alaska, Canada, Mexico and the surrounding water areas out 500 nautical miles. She also stated that the NORTHCOM missions are Homeland Defense (HD), Defense Support of Civil Authorities (DSCA), and Theater Security Cooperation (TSC).
- She explained the distinction between missions for North America and within the United States as related to Homeland Defense (HD), Defense Support of Civil Authorities (DSCA), and Theater Security Cooperation (TSC).

#### **0950 Break**

#### **1000 – The Honorable Patrick M. Shanahan, Deputy Secretary of Defense**

- Secretary Shanahan began his discussion with the Board by describing his past positions in the business world, and how this experience can benefit the Department. He stated that as a former executive with Boeing, he has experience in improving large organizations and managing large, complex programs.
- The remainder of Mr. Shanahan's comments focused on two areas: strategy, budgeting, execution, and utilizing the whole of government approach in addressing our country's challenges. Regarding strategy, he said that the Secretary has been focused on developing the new National Defense Strategy rather quickly because he wants to make sure it can be used during this term and that it will be complimentary to the National Security Strategy. It will also set specific guidelines and goals for the Department and will also address readiness and define where capability and capacity will be applied. Mr. Shanahan briefed that the strategy also drives the budget, which he is optimistic about. He anticipates using the first quarter of CY 2018 to translate the strategy into guidance.

- Secretary Shanahan also talked about changes and improvement to execution. He is overseeing a restructuring effort which will change the organization for the long term, specifically with business processes. The Services will be incentivized to operate smartly and save money. He also intends to streamline the contracting process, targeting IT and healthcare first.
- Finally, Secretary Shanahan discussed the importance of using the whole of government. He stated that it was important to build the right relationships with other governmental agencies to ensure they are collectively attacking the Nation's problems.
- Secretary Shanahan finished his time with the Board by answering questions. Chairman Punaro asked about the streamlining processes and reducing overhead by combining processes, specifically in areas like human resources and healthcare, among the Services. Mr. Shanahan stated that DoD standards should be the same across the Services and where there are areas where processes are the same, perhaps they should look at standardizing them.

#### **1045 – Break**

#### **1125 – U.S. Cyber Command (USCYBERCOM) Training and Certification Program**

**- Major General Sheila Zuehlke, USAFR (Retired), Subcommittee on Enhancing DoD's Role in the Homeland Member**

**- RAML David Dermanelian, USCG, J7, Director, Exercise & Training, USCYBERCOM**

- Major General Zuehlke reviewed findings from the 2014 RFPB Cyber Task Force, noting that the focus was on the Cyber Mission Force, which is only a small part of DoD cyber operations. She then introduced RDML Dermanelian to provide a briefing on Cyber training structures and initiatives.
- RDML Dermanelian discussed USCYBERCOM's cyber training and certification program, noting an imperative from the CYBERCOM Commander to integrate Reserve Component forces across the spectrum of cyber operations. He noted that the National Guard brings state and industry partners, but that more work must be done to integrate these partners in an unclassified environment.
- He summarized the Persistent Cyber Training Environment, which will provide standardized baseline training and capability while allowing for home station training, which is critical for Reserve Component recruiting and retention.
- RDML Dermanelian also covered some of the remaining questions and issues for further development of Reserve Component cyber capabilities, to include the role of forces under state authority and how those forces could or should coordinate with USCYBERCOM.

**\*\*End of Closed Meeting\*\***



## **1205 Break**

### **1210 – Standards of Ethical Conduct for Advisory Committee Members Brief (Administrative Session)**

**-Mr. Scott Thompson, Standards of Conduct Office, Office of General Council**

- Mr. Thompson conducted a Standards of Ethical Conduct briefing for Advisory Committee Members with opportunity for questions and answers.

## **1255 – Transition to Open Meeting**

**\*\*Start of Open Meeting\*\*  
(Unclassified)**

### **1300 – Chairman's Welcome and Opening Remarks**

**-Major General Arnold L. Punaro, USMCR (Ret), *Chairman, RFPB***

**-Mr. Alex Sabol, Designated Federal Officer's Remarks**

- The Chairman called the meeting to order and announced, as required by the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), that the Designated Federal Officer was present and had pre-approved the opening of the meeting and the agenda.
- The Chairman announced the meeting was open to the public and noted no persons had submitted requests to appear before the Board. The Chairman asked if anyone present wished to address the Board and no one indicated a desire to do so.

## **1305 – Maj Gen Derek Rydholm, USAFR, Deputy Chief, Air Force Reserve**

- Major Gen Rydholm focused on three areas during his comments to the Board – the Air Force Reserve (AFR) Foundational Principles, Chief of Air Force Reserve (CAFR) Focus Areas and AFR Challenges.
- He stated that the Foundational Principles of the AFR were the focus of recruiting of personnel with prior service, providing daily operational capability and strategic depth, and ensuring a sustainable professional military force.
  - Maj Gen Rydholm mentioned that the top priority is recruiting Airmen transitioning from the Active Component. The AFR prefers Airmen already trained, making an immediate use of their capabilities minimizing training costs. Last year 38% of their accessions were non-prior service, which increased their training costs and resulted in delayed readiness.
  - Regarding daily operational capability, he stated that last year the Air Force Reserve Command was the fourth largest contributor to combat operations and has shown no signs of slowing down. He briefed that 6,000 Air Force Reservists on active duty orders operate in air, space and cyber domains supporting overseas contingencies and other stateside operations.

- He then stated that the AFR has several initiatives underway to ensure a sustainable professional military force. He emphasized that they will continue to integrate with the Active Component supplying reservists to fill key leadership positions through the Voluntary Limited Period of Active Duty (VLPAD) program and that they will continue to integrate with the Active Component when it properly leverages the strength of our Reserve force. Maj Gen Rydholm mentioned that two-thirds of the Air Force's TFI Associations are with the Reserve. He also mentioned the I-Wing pilot program 916th ARW, Seymour Johnson AFB.
- Maj Gen Rydholm discussed the Chief of Air Force Reserve's (CAFR) Focus Areas next. First, AFR will remain focused on readiness to enable the Air Force and partners to succeed. Next, the AFR will align their strategy and focus with the CSAF focus areas of revitalizing the squadron, strengthening joint leaders and teams, and multi-domain command and control. The AFR will ensure their strategy accomplished the following:
  - Preserves foundational principles, capabilities, programs, and policies
  - Builds on today's capabilities that ensure we are always there – ready to win
  - Shapes the future force by leveraging the strengths and diversity our Reserve Citizen Airmen bring to the fight
- Finally, Maj Gen Rydholm discussed challenges the AFR faces in four areas: manning, aircraft and systems, infrastructure, and budget.
  - Regarding manning, he stated that the AFR is short 379 pilots, and to address the issue, the AFR has programmed an increase in the recruiting budget, internally funded career advisors to access and retain prior-service pilots, and that they are also working with the Active Component to develop solutions across the enterprise. He concluded the manning issue stating that the AFR is also addressing critical manning issues in the aircraft maintenance area.
  - Maj Gen Rydholm mentioned that AFR aircraft and systems are an average age nine years older than the Active Component which is the oldest their inventory has ever been. He stated that modernization would help solve the legacy aircraft supply chain and test equipment issues. He also stated that the weapons system sustainment funding has been below 80% for the past few years. He highlighted that without NGREA the AFR could not sustain their legacy aircraft on par with the Active duty.
  - Regarding infrastructure, Maj Gen Rydholm said Reserve readiness is affected, and that without sufficient military construction funding, their ability to support mission requirements is limited. He stated that the AFR maximizes cost-effectiveness by sharing facilities and infrastructure with the Active Component.
  - Finally, he emphasized that sequestration and the Continuing Resolutions negatively affect AFR's readiness. He said this impacts unit readiness and training because when units do not have access to funds, they cannot plan and that unit training events are affected because of the uncertainty that surrounds getting members paid.



**1350– Texas National Guard Response to Hurricane Harvey**

**-Major General John Nichols, ANG, The Adjutant General, Texas National Guard**

**-Brigadier General Patrick Hamilton, ARNG, TX Dual Status Commander for Hurricane Harvey**

- Maj Gen Nichols and BG Hamilton summarized the preparation for a response to Hurricane Harvey and the associated flooding along the Texas Gulf Coast and in Houston. They noted this storm was unique because it unexpectedly strengthened rapidly and then stalled over Houston, complicating preparations efforts.
- They discussed response efforts unique to Texas, such as using a pre-established contract with Wal-Mart and H.E.B. to use existing business infrastructure to move essential supplies to affected areas in the immediate aftermath of a large scale disaster. They also discussed lessons learned from this event, including the need to integrate over 19,000 reservists in the state into plans, and the need for a method to track and account for forces operating under immediate response authority to ensure coordination and prevent duplication of effort with scarce resources.
- General Nichols and General Hamilton raised a question about authorities and reimbursement to states affected by similar large-scale disasters, noting that Texas was well positioned financially to respond, but other states might not be. They suggested the RFPB revisit recommendations made in 2012 regarding domestic response funding and reimbursement to look at improving response capabilities and times.

**1435– National Chair, Employer Support of the Guard and Reserve**

**- General Craig R. McKinley, USAF (Retired)**

- Joining Gen McKinley from the ESGR chain of command were CAPT Juliet Perkins, Mr. Judd Lyons, CMSgt Amanda Bertrand, Mr. Travis Bartholomew, Mr. Matt Dubois, and Mr. Bill Booth.
- Gen McKinley discussed the Employer Support of the Guard and Reserve's mission that uses predominately volunteers to facilitate and promote a cooperative culture of employer support for National Guard and Reserve. Their biggest ongoing push is to ensure employers are not "surprised" by the continuing operations that require National Guard/Reserve mobilizations, even after 16 years of operations.
- ESGR is exploring ways to link up transitioning members with potential employers in each member's respective home of record.
- MG Orr suggested there should be a Strategic Message to educate the public and employers more about our operational RC.

**1520 – Closing Remarks by Military Executive, Reserve Forces Policy Board**

**- Major General Walter Lord, ARNG**

**1525 – Closing Remarks by Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board**

**- Major General (Ret) Arnold Punaro**

- Chairman Punaro thanked all in attendance for their support of the RFPB and the men and women of the Reserve Components. The Reserve Forces Policy Board concluded business, and the meeting was adjourned.

**\*\*End of Open Meeting\*\***

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Arnold L. Punaro', with a long, sweeping horizontal line extending to the right.

Arnold L. Punaro  
Major General, USMCR (Ret)  
Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board